



APRIL 5, 2009

Scratch Proof your HTC Touch Diamond

ZAGG.com/invisibleSHIELD Feedback - Ads by Google

- HOME
- POLITICS
- MEDIA
- BUSINESS
- ENTERTAINMENT
- LIVING
- STYLE
- GREEN
- WORLD
- CHICAGO
- COMEDY 23/6
- VIDEO
- BLOGGER INDEX
- ARCHIVE
- Twitter: Follow Us
- Get Email Alerts
- Make HuffPost Your HomePage

Madonna Jets Out Of Malawi

More in Entertainment: 'Fast' Rakes In \$72.5M... Madonna Tot's Dad Found... Farrah's Son Arrested...

Farrah Fawcett Is Hospitalized



Michael Giltz

- BIO
- Become a Fan
- Get Email Alerts
- Similar Bloggers

American Idol Top 10: The Results

Posted March 26, 2008 | 01:58 AM (EST)

Read More: Brooke White, Carly Smithson, Chikezie, Chris Cornell, David Archuleta, David Cook, Gladys Knight, Jason Castro, John Farnham, Michael Jackson, Michael Johns, Paula Abdul, Police, Pop Music, Queen, Ramele Malubay, Randy Jackson, Reality TV, Ryan Seacret, Simon Cowell, Soundgarden, Stephanie Mills, Sting, Syesha Mercado, Breaking Entertainment News



NOTE: And **Chikezie is gone**. The gang began with a performance of Maxine Nightingale's biggest hit "Right Back Where We Started From," which hit #2 for two weeks in 1976. (They should have tied into the theme of birthdays and done one from Ryan's year of 1974 instead.) No one stood out except for the dorky chest-bumping of Michael Johns and David Cook.

We found out they keep the number of downloads on iTunes a secret each week so seeing how popular some singers are doesn't influence the vote. Cruelly, we see Brooke recording her tune and being told by a producer to "watch your pitch!" Ouch. Kimberly Locke had a solid debut album but took years to record a followup. During that time she opened a restaurant, lost weight and seems relatively balanced. I loved her debut single "Eighth World Wonder" and her new tune "Fall" ain't up to that standard but it's fine. Dolly Parton is the mentor next week (I couldn't be more excited) and they take those stupid calls again.

- Email
- Print
- Comments

Buzz up! Be the First to Submit This Story to Digg

The Bottom Three -- It's Chikezie, Syesha (!) and Jason Castro. The only one I got right was Chikezie, proving yet again that I am way off base this season in predictions. Jason is the first to be safe, leaving Syesha and Chikezie, disproving those who look for block voting and figured the remaining two black contestants would get enough support for at least one

of them to stay safe(r). Clearly the Filipino vote is on heavy speed-dial for Ramele who was the worst last week by a mile. But frankly, with 30 million votes cast, it doesn't matter what contingent you have supporting you (evangelical, country, etc.), unless your initials are "D" and "A" you need to appeal to Middle America to stay safe. Still, seeing Syesha in the bottom three when she was easily one of the two or three best last night is shocking. Beware the power of Simon, who has been down on her for weeks. He's the one America listens to. Sorry Randy and Paula. Thank goodness Chikezie is sent home. Maybe this wasn't his week (I thought he'd be in the bottom two, though so

NEIL YOUNG
FORK IN THE ROAD
HIS LATEST ALBUM FEATURES 10 NEW SONGS

AVAILABLE
APRIL 7

CLICK HERE TO EXPERIENCE THE ALBUM
NELLYOUNG.COM

Popular Stories on HuffPost

- Fashion Face-Off! Michelle Obama And Carla Bruni-Sarkozy Finally Meet In France (VIDEO, PHOTOS, POLL)
*Video, poll and slideshow
- Levi Johnston Talks Safe Sex With Tyra Banks (VIDEO)
UPDATE 8:30pm: People.com is reporting that Sarah Palin has issued...
- Oscar de la Renta Slams Michelle Obama's Buckingham Outfit As Major Designers Feel Ignored
While Michelle Obama has made lesser...
- Verena von Pfetten 7 Lessons To Be Learned From Carla Bruni
So here's the thing. There's no shortage of articles dedicated to that certain je ne...
- Huff TV Arianna Discusses Michelle Obama's "Fantastic" Style On CBS

I'm hardly shocked). But it was only a matter of time. Do you agree with him going?

BELOW IS MY INITIAL RUNDOWN OF THE PERFORMANCE SHOW ON TUESDAY

Now we're at the Top 10 -- the ten singers who know they'll be going on tour and now are quietly thinking to themselves, "Hey, I could WIN this!" According to the judges, we had four great performances. According to me, two.

Ramiele Malubay -- The theme of the night is songs from the year you were born, which meant an official rush on 1987, beginning with Ramiele. She sang Heart's "Alone," the biggest hit of the band's career (by far) which was #1 for three weeks. Dressed as if it were 1982 and she were singing a song from *Flashdance*, Ramiele had an off-the-shoulder sweatshirt sort of top and pummeled the song into submission. The slow moment at the beginning wasn't bad and the end was a relief. She was screeching in the middle and the highlight clip at the end of the show did her no favors. All three judges were negative. Simon was technically right in pointing out that it was better than last week but probably wrong when he said being better than the week before (when she was awful) means Ramiele should be safe. Doesn't work like that. People rarely give you a storehouse of good will once it gets down to the nitty gritty (unless your initials are "D" and "A").

Jason Castro -- He glided through Sting's "Fragile," a mellow sensitive number from 1987 that is right in Jason's wheelhouse. It was never a single, but it's a classic track from Sting's best solo album *...Nothing Like The Sun*. It's a great choice for Jason, who sits down, strums away at his guitar and shows off some Spanish (or was it Portuguese?) to go along with the French from Beatles week. Definitely working the international tip. Yes, his voice almost disappears and he's still singing out of the side of his mouth, but a good performance. Randy and Paula are mixed and Simon is negative. Randy says Jason didn't do anything with the vocals since he's never happy when people just deliver the song rather than throwing in runs and trills. Simon says it sounds like someone busking in a subway. Yes, but someone good who would make you stop and listen. Wisely, Jason doesn't talk back or comment while the judges are talking. I swear, if Joao Gilberto were a contestant, they'd say, "Another bossa nova? Come on, mix it up, dude." Jason is wise to do what he does best. Go down swinging. My only concern is that many people might not know the song, even though it's becoming a standard in the jazz world.

Sysha Mercado -- Sings the Gladys Knight and the Pips 1971 classic "If I Were Your Woman," which was covered by Stephanie Mills on her album of the same name in 1987. The 'fro is back, the big earrings are in place and Sysha tops last week's peak cover of "Yesterday" with a sensational performance that is controlled and passionate. I've had a crush on her from the start and she's finally coming through and coming into her own at just the right moment. This is the real Kelly Clarkson -- someone who was overlooked repeatedly but keeps improving. Now let's see her do it again. The judges all rave, though Simon is ever so slightly less rave-ish.

Chikezie -- If Ramiele was the weakest, Chikezie is the most forgettable. Born in 1985, he covers a Luther Vandross gem, "If Only For One Night." His voice wavers a bit, he's very rough on the last line and it's rather dull. He was right to sing a ballad -- don't kick yourself for losing when you didn't do what you really wanted; accept losing when you went with your gut. And another manic song would have been awful. The judges run the gamut, with Randy negative, Paula positive and Simon mixed. I can't remember the performance as soon as it's over.

Brooke White -- Born in 1983, Brooke sings the massive Police hit "Every Breath You Take," which was their only #1 hit but at least they made the most of it: it was #1 for eight weeks and virtually inescapable for about a year. Unfortunately, Brooke thinks it's a love song instead of a song of suspicion and paranoia, which keeps her from really burrowing into it. Wisely she sits at the piano and sings it, first solo and then with the band kicking in. She gets complimented for screwing up and starting over (You're human! We love you!) and criticized for having the band join in halfway through. Of course, if she'd stayed with just the piano, the judges might have criticized her for NOT having the band joining in and insisting it was dull. Because what they're really saying is that it wasn't a very good performance. Competent and colorless. Again, she won't stop talking when the judges offer their critique. They're mixed, with Randy negative, Paula positive and Simon mixed. Randy's latest verbal tic is to say it was a "very interesting song choice." Really? One of the biggest hits of all time that works right into her singer-songwriter vein?

Michael Johns -- Born in 1978, Michael does a medley of the Queen double-a side hit "We Will Rock You/We Are The Champions," the greatest future-sports-standard single of all time, though it only hit #4 on the pop charts. The "We Will Rock You" half is very anonymous and you notice the

"Washington Unplugged"

Arianna was on CBS' "Washington..."

Huff TV Arianna Appears on ABC's "This Week" Roundtable With George Stephanopoulos (VIDEO)

Arianna was a guest this morning on...

"BRUNO" TRAILER! Calamity, African Babies, Chase Scenes And More (NSFW VIDEO)

IT'S HERE! The trailer for this July's Sacha Baron Cohen...

NATO Leaders Focus On Afghanistan, But Most Reject Obama's Plea For Troops (SLIDESHOW)

STRASBOURG, France — On the eve of the NATO...

First Lady Fashion At Friday's NATO Concert (PHOTOS)

Another night, another fashion opportunity for NATO leaders and their spouses! See...

Diana Palin, Sarah Palin's Sister-In-Law, Arrested For Breaking Into Home

ANCHORAGE, Alaska — Police say Alaska Gov....

John Oliver Explains The Real Reason You Never Touch The Queen (VIDEO)

John Oliver was upset enough to drop his monocle when he...

Jim Cramer Declares The Depression "Over" (VIDEO)

On Thursday's episode of "Mad Money" host Jim Cramer declared that the depression...

New Jay Leno Show Rejected By NBC Affiliate In Boston

BOSTON — Boston's NBC affiliate says it will air a local newscast instead of...

Scientists Find Rocket Fuel Chemical In Infant Formula

ATLANTA — Traces of a chemical used in rocket fuel were found in samples of...

Ice Bridge Ruptures In Antarctic (VIDEO)

An ice bridge linking a shelf of ice the size of

difference when he jumps into the mellow beginning of "We Are The Champions" and suddenly there's color and personality in his voice. But not that much. He loses his breath at the end of one line and smartly thrusts his microphone triumphantly into the air to cover-up that fact. Michael, as always, poses like a rock star perfectly -- when they do a movie about Michael Hutchence of INXS, Johns is their man. And he does have a good finish. Really, it's his best (or rather only good) performance since...Queen's "Bohemian Rhapsody" during Hollywood Week. The judges love it unreservedly. If only every week were Queen week.

Carly Smithson -- Born in 1983, Carly tackles the Bonnie Tyler epic "Total Eclipse of the Heart." Bonnie Tyler is the only person to be a one hit wonder twice. First she did it in 1978 with the country-ish tune "It's A Heartache," which hit #3. Then she came back five years later with a complete makeover musically, really seeming like an entirely different person, thanks to the kitchen sink production of producer Jim Steinman (of Meat Loaf fame) who gave her this #1 hit which stayed on top for four weeks. Carly has serious heels on and lays into the tune, even doing a writhing sort of motion as she really gets into it. Mostly spot on, with a weak final flourish. Generally solid. Randy again says it was a "very interesting song choice." Really, I say again? A massive smash hit that lets Carly brandish that big voice? He insists it's really too rock and out of her comfort zone stylistically. The judges are mixed again with Randy negative, Paula positive and Simon mixed.

David Archuleta -- Born in 1990, David digs up Aussie singer John Farnham's "You're The Voice," which scraped into the Hot 100 that year, was a solid Top 10 hit in the UK, and a massive hit in Australia, where it appeared in 1986 on the best-selling album in Aussie history. (Farnham also sang with Little River Band.) Simon insisted David couldn't possibly have picked this song himself, but David being the pro that he is just said it was a terrific song and that John Farnham is great. Unlike the Beatles song, he certainly seemed familiar with it. A more lively upbeat tune, "You're The Voice" is still "inspirational," which is the house where David lives. He bounces back and forth, tries to keep his diva hands under control and does a credible, decent performance of a song almost no one watching has ever heard of. It's not great, he has a rough patch and loses his voice for a moment but he ends very strongly on a big *Idol* note. The judges are positive but it's not the usual Archuleta slam dunk.

Kristy Lee Cook -- Born in 1984, Kristy chooses the Lee Greenwood flag-waver "God Bless The USA," which is inextricably linked with Reagan's America in my mind. She gets giant American flags waving in the background, a big brass arrangement and delivers her best performance ever!! Though it's still pretty anonymous. Hey, if you can't sing "Amazing Grace" every week, this is your next best bet. Next week: the national anthem. Actually, she really does fine and though both Randy and Paula caution her about pitch, she sounds on key to me the whole time. And I just dare anyone to kick her off the show after singing this song! It would be like booing the beauty pageant contestant who waves the flag while twirling a baton and holding up sparklers on the Fourth of July. Insanely, the judges compliment Kristy on such a savvy, clever song choice. Are they out of their minds? It's the most patriotic, heart-tugging OBVIOUS song choice in the world for a country oriented singer who needs to tap into Middle America. You want the audience to stand up? You sing "God Bless The USA."

David Cook -- Born in 1982, Cook tackles the Michael Jackson career-defining classic "Billie Jean" via the cover by Chris Cornell of Soundgarden. It's really a triumph, with Cook delivering the goods especially during a tricky vocal passage towards the end when his voice goes up into a higher register. This slow-burning rocker is exactly what he does and I fear his album might be a tiresomely moody, mid-tempo affair. But contrasted with the pop and soul offerings of the other singers, his emo sensibility is always welcome relief. He was rough on the last note, but who cares? The judges rave and rightly so, though Cook needs to stop the hokey bowing with the "hands clasped in humble thanks" gesture. He's been very, very consistent the last few weeks and notice the judges don't complain a bit about him doing the same thing again and again. Not when it works this well. Chris Daughtry might have been jealous if his solo career hadn't been so explosively successful.

So the judges thought Syesha, Michael Johns, Kristy Lee Cook and David Cook were all terrific. I'd agree about Syesha and David Cook (the two stand-outs to me) and certainly Johns and Kristy are safe. I think David Archuleta is safe as well and given that he sang an utterly obscure song and not that well, that tells you how strong his fanbase really is.



HUFFPOST'S BIG NEWS PAGES

Computers	India	Barack Obama
Michelle Obama	Sports	Olympics
Housing Crisis	Fox News	Cars

[MORE BIG NEWS PAGES](#)

Books by this author

This Blogger's Books from

A cabin of one's own: New England's MacDowell Colony celebrates 100 years of artistic utopia. And the gay and lesbian artists who prospered there celebrate ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

Affairs to remember: Farley Granger bedded Ava Gardner, Shelley Winters, and Leonard Bernstein. In his autobiography, Include Me Out, Hitchcock's muse ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

[Bloggers Index](#) ▶

[Read All Posts by Michael Giltz](#) ▶

Related News

[Politics](#)
[Levi Johnston Talks Safe Sex With Tyra Banks \(VIDEO\)](#)

[Style](#)
[Michelle Obama Hugs Queen Elizabeth, Stirs Controversy \(PHOTOS, POLL, VIDEO\)](#)

[World](#)
[Obama Breaks Up 'Heated' Spat Between Sarkozy, Hu Jintao](#)
[Related Blog Posts](#)



Potentially vulnerable are Ramiele, Jason, Chikezie, Brooke and Carly. Don't forget, Carly was in the bottom three last time. But I think she was solid enough and she certainly delivered a straight rendition of the tune. Jason, I believe, coasts by on charm yet again. That leaves Ramiele, Chikezie, and Brooke in the bottom three. Chikezie and Brooke were both forgettable. But Ramiele was awful. I predict Ramiele and Chikezie in the bottom two. Since Ramiele was the first and the worst, she's going home. Who was your favorite and who do you think will be sent home?

Email Print Comments

Like this story? Get Alerts of big news events. Enter your email address

More in Entertainment...

SNL: Madonna And Angelina In Weekend Update...

Reality Star Jade Goody Buried In Lavish...

Robert De Niro Nanny Sues For \$40,000

Alex Da Silva, Celebrity Choreographer Accused Of...

digg HuffPost Stories Surging Right Now

Michelle Obama's Clothing Has Sean Hannity All Out Of Sorts

Cenk Uygur: Have We Reached the Tipping Point on Guns?

RICHARD POPLAWSKI, Pittsburgh Gunman, Kills 3 Police Officers

Dr. Rachel Ehrenfeld: Does Iran Harbor Osama bin Laden?

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy w/the Free Videos Toolbar Videos.alottoolbars.com



Comments 34 Pending Comments 0
FAQ: Comments & Moderation FAQ: HuffPost Accounts

Want to reply to a comment? Hint: Click "Reply" at the bottom of the comment; after being approved your comment will appear directly underneath the comment you replied to

View Comments: Newest First Expand All

Musicated See Profile I'm a Fan of Musicated permalink

It's just theory but we've seen this phenomenon before where a contestant, in my example Ramiele, begins a 'tanking' procedure where their peak has long past but, for whatever the reason, their fan support continues to pull them through troubled waters even though their performances are horrible. The result is that better singers are knocked out of the competition as a matter of attrition and it looks to me like Ramiele is on one of those rolls. Of course, she'll eventually be ousted but not without some damage in her wake. Nikki McKibbin from season one always comes to mind, or as recently as the infamous Sanjaya.

If you're looking to apply logical critique to the outcome of these weekly cuts then there is a very good

Style: Bonnie Fuller Michelle Obama's Lost Her Mind! 3 Reasons She's Suddenly A Fashion Disaster



Style: Verena von Pfetten 7 Lessons To Be Learned From Carla Bruni



Style: Verena von Pfetten Brow-O-Wow: Bushy Eyebrows Make A Comeback (PHOTOS, POLL)

Related Tags

- Brooke White Carly Smithson Chikezie Chris Cornell David Archuleta David Cook Gladys Knight Jason Castro John Farnham Michael Jackson Michael Johns Paula Abdul Police Pop Music Queen Ramiele Malubay Randy Jackson Reality TV Ryan Seacret Simon Cowell Soundgarden Stephanie Mills Sting Syesha Mercado

iContact Email Marketing Simplified Become An Email Marketing EXPERT Introducing... the Secret to Effective Email Marketing TRY IT NOW FOR FREE

chance that you'll be wrong because the factors influencing the voting outcome are so varied and unpredictable that it becomes, well, unpredictable.

So the next time you're trying to make sense of these Idol results, just remember that there are way more 13 year olds with the stamina to keep dialing the phone long after you've lost interest and it's best not to underestimate the influence of the judge's comments that are often applied for a particular effect.

But, hey, it's still a fun little melodrama and, embarrassingly, I haven't missed an episode since day one. Yikes.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 01:30 AM on 03/28/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

To think I'd forgotten about Nikki McKibbin! Shame on me. You're right about the eliminations being unpredictable. It's just I've done a much better job of guessing right in seasons past. What should be more predictable is the people that are safe: David Cook and David Archuleta. Whoever else falls by the wayside, those two should at least make the final three.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 02:36 PM on 03/28/2008

DCDan See Profile I'm a Fan of DCDan permalink

Yet ANOTHER twist on the Double-A-side thing! The two Queen songs were conventionally released on 45 as A side (We Are The Champions) and B side (We Will Rock You). It is the conventional wisdom now that they were released as a double-A side. However, they are generally played together (much to my chagrin, personally, cause I hate both songs) on the radio as a medley because that is how the songs appear on the LP News of the World, Tracks 1 and 2 of Side 1, back to back.

In the Beatles case (to follow up on your previous request from clarification), the double A's were as follows: Day Tripper/We Can Work It Out, Yellow Submarine/Eleanor Rigby, Penny Lane/Strawberry Fields, Come Together/Something. Rationale for doing it this way is, with two strong songs, basically, let the public sort it out, let demand dictate via radio which is more popular. Not to mention, radio programmers and DJs had much more sway in those days long before a few corporations controlled most nationwide playlists in affecting rotation of singles. Hope this helps. Hard to explain so concisely in this format.

[Please see your 3/20 post, "Top 11: Results," for belated response to other ongoing Beatles discussions, Mr. Giltz]

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 03:10 PM on 03/27/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

If I keep up these flubs, I'm gonna have to turn in my music trivia geek card. Another question: HOW is it determined when a single is an A side and B side or actually a double A-side? Is it just labeled that way? Is there some pricing distinction? Is it when both songs appear on the album? Not sure how we can know it when we see it. And here I thought I was being so clever and learning my lesson when it came to Queen. I don't hate those two songs - - amazingly -- despite hearing them eight zillion times at sporting events. Maybe I associate them now with the Yankees staging a rally.

Thanks for the clarification. If only "Strawberry Fields/Penny Lane" (often dubbed the greatest single of all time thanks to two such classic and diverse tracks) had appeared on Sgt Pepper where they belonged that landmark album would have been even better.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 02:41 PM on 03/28/2008

LeoMarvin See Profile I'm a Fan of LeoMarvin permalink

I don't know. Maybe I'm getting old and cranky, but I think this year's crop looks better and sings worse than last year's (with some notable exceptions -- hello, Sanjaya). I have to keep reminding myself that this is a country that chose Taylor Hicks and George W. Bush. Twice.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 10:00 PM on 03/26/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

You're not cranky -- just discriminating. I didn't pull for Taylor Hicks but I wouldn't write him off yet. Maybe his second album (the ones where the artists actually have a little control over the content) will let him show his inner Michael McDonald a little better. I never write any of them off till the second CD is out. That's the one that indicates their potential a lot better than the first. And hey, the popular vote was for Gore, not Bush -- and even the electoral college is debatable, so don't hold Bush's first term against the voters too much. Now, the second term, that's another story.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:45 PM on 03/28/2008

mch755 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of mch755](#) [permalink](#)

Here's my take:

Favorites:

1. David Cook- say what you will about the same ole thing each week, he nailed "Billie Jean". He is really being steady every week offering what he does best, rock vibes to very familiar songs. I say keep doing what your doing since the judges love it.
2. Syesha- I wasn't real familiar with the song but she sang it well, I wish she had kept the straight hair since she looked so nice last week. She's building on last week and thats a good thing.
3. Michael- Finally a good performance from the Aussie! Though the stadium like lights in the background kept blinding me! He sang pretty confidently so kudos for him.

Semi favorite:

1. David A- I had no idea what the song was that he was singing when I heard it. Not sure why someone on AI would pick a song no one knows, but he sang it ok. Not that great but the tweens will keep him on board. The guy needs to do more uptempo stuff, tired of the FM Lite songbook!

Non favorites:

1. Ramiele- Poor little Ramiele, up first and just didn't sound that great. Her voice seemed to go in and out for me, sometimes it sounded fine and next it sounded terrible. I was cringing in my sofa thinking this is it for her, I hope not, so I voted extra for her.

2. Kristy Lee- ugh...total pandering, enough said.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 09:55 PM on 03/26/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

So YOU'RE the reason Ramiele stayed in this week! You're def right about the blinding "rock star" lights during Michael Johns' performance. I'm always looking to see who gets the most lavish, favorable production each week from the producers (hey, they've got their favorites just like everyone else) and Michael Johns and Kristy Lee Cook were def the ones to get the full court press this week. Please let Ramiele go home next week (assuming her performance is just as weak) -- she's gone far enough.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:48 PM on 03/28/2008

mch755 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of mch755](#) [permalink](#)

Ha..ha.. yeah, me and quite a number of people are voting for the little one, Ramiele. I really feel she's due for great performance, my feeling is she's learning, I hope, what works for her and what she needs to do. She doesn't have the experience of old hands like Carly, David A or Michael. So I really think she'll bring it this coming week, and if she doesn't I promise I won't vote extra for her! I am getting tired of being disappointed week after week. GO RAMIELE!!!

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:36 AM on 03/29/2008

observing [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of observing](#) [permalink](#)

Forgive my ignorance. What does emo mean? I've seen it before....Emoting?

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 06:15 PM on 03/26/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

The only sign of ignorance is NOT asking what a word of idea means that you haven't heard of before. Asking is a sign of intelligence. "Emo" is a very loosely defined genre of music that today sort of/kind of refers to rock bands with passionate soaring, anthemic choruses bordering on hard rock, which is the makeover David Cook has given to a number of tunes. It sprang out of the hardcore punk scene via bands like Fugazi and Sunny Day Real Estate. It evolved into something more melodic via Dashboard Confessional and Jimmy Eat World. Today it's thrown around by fools like me to describe any sort of moody rocker that explodes or even gets a little grungey and hardcore on their choruses (my favorite emo band is the indie group Signal The Escape which has sort of gone through the entire evolution of emo in their brief career and is now more melodic than ever. The early acts sound NOTHING like Cook and would have nothing to do with him and most of the people tagged as "emo" hate the term as much as minimalists like Philip Glass and Steve Reich hate that label.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:55 PM on 03/28/2008

Muscated [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Muscated](#) [permalink](#)

One thing is for sure...David Cook is a very smart contestant and his calculations and performances have pretty much been on point. Say what you will about that particular version of "Billie Jean", he nailed it within an inch of its life and right now he's wearing the 'Mr. Consistency' label.

The conventional wisdom in our living room was that Carly Smithson's version of Bonnie Tyler's hit was superior to Tyler's...that is until the dreaded 'reach' at the end. It was like a hockey game and there's a mad rush with some great passes and then, ohhhhh, the shot's high and sails over the crossbar. She was oh so close but, alas, murdered the ending.

You're right Michael, Kristy Lee Cook played the "Amazing Grace" card once again with that Lee Greenwood flag-waver that is very low on my list of songs because it's so transparent in its design and that makes it a compositional weakling in my estimation. Translation: I love my country and hate that song.

What fascinates me about Chikezie is that he actually has a good set of pipes but the confusion that he exhibits in terms of measuring criticism is now officially wreaking havoc with his brain. He looked crushed. Do what the other musical greats do: pop a Xanax and blow the whole thing off. Jason Castro has made this pleasant indifference into an art form right before our eyes.

♥ Favorite ⚡ Flag as abusive Posted 05:41 PM on 03/26/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Good analysis -- especially of Jason's mellow appeal. But I can't support believing any singer has one-upped the drama queen Bonnie Tyler; until Carly gets that rasp in her voice, she'll always be in Bonnie's shadow on that song.

♥ Favorite ⚡ Flag as abusive Posted 03:07 AM on 03/27/2008

Charity See Profile I'm a Fan of Charity permalink

what is up with simon and his infatuation with brooke? he continues to praise her for what is ostensibly a weak voice with absolutely no range whatsoever. the one time she sang something upbeat, she blew it.

simon, even when damning her with faint praise this week, managed to work in the word 'fantastic' in relation to her. as in 'could have been fantastic....' hence, leaving impressionable viewers with the words "fantastic and brooke" in their minds even though she was neither and he meant neither.

contrast this to other singers this week who did far better than ms. brooke; simon took great pains to damn them all, pretty much, with nary a mention of the word 'fantastic' in any sense of the word (reverse negative or whatever). while he liked syesha this week, he has been consistent in damning nearly all of her performances, which primarily have been far and above anything brooke OR david cook has done.

this is the first season in all the seasons of idol that i have detected something odd about the judges comments in that their comments don't seem to match the reality of the performances unless it is unquestionably, by anyone standards, good.

if simon were to consistently spread his infatuation around other contestants such as two strong singers such as syesha and carly, one would not see those two end up in the bottom three as they have previously.

♥ Favorite ⚡ Flag as abusive Posted 02:15 PM on 03/26/2008

DCDan See Profile I'm a Fan of DCDan permalink

Charity,

Couldn't agree more that the judges are wildly inconsistent in their praise. They constantly parrot the notion that it's "A Singing Competition" then they cream all over themselves when mediocre singers like Kristy, by far the worst singer left, and Michael, the least technically proficient male singer, do their big production numbers, the treacly "God Bless the USA" and overblown Queen medley, respectively. They need be honest with themselves and the contestants. This isn't so much a singing or talent competition as a PAGEANT, plain and simple. If it were truly just a singing competition, the best performances last night were from Syeesha, Chakizie, and Carly (save for the dreadful bum note at the very end).

On another subject, Charity, still not "over" my hatred for Yoko Ono. It is richly deserved. Thanks for the sermon though. Glad you've made your peace with the beast.

♥ Favorite ⚡ Flag as abusive Posted 05:39 PM on 03/26/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Charity, the judges have seemed more self-involved than usual this season, always a danger as they get so much attention themselves and their interplay is one of the few consistent elements of the show and thus overdone at times. Like everyone else, the judges have their favorites and aren't shy about it. Simon announced Carrie Underwood would win it all even before Hollywood Week, which should have taken the excitement out of everything especially since she was so dominant and apparently won the voting every week by a mile, the way I suspect Archuleta is doing. And when you have favorites (we all do), it colors your review. But I don't think it's anything more nefarious than putting the kids you think are the most talented in the best light .

DC Dan, it is indeed more than just a singing competition - people who are likable, do well on camera, have good interplay w Ryan and the judges will do better than a singer who doesn't do well on those extra-curricular activities, just like a real pop singer who gives good press and charms radio does better than one who gives boring or obnoxious interviews and ticks off deejays and programmers with their attitude. As for Yoko, she's done a very good job managing John's legacy. She's faced enough vitriol and the Beatles would have broken up anyway.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 03:21 AM on 03/27/2008

There are More Comments on this Thread. [Click Here To See them All](#)

luziannagirl [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of luziannagirl](#) [permalink](#)

Who's my favorite, and who do I think will get sent home?

Well, since two of my three favorites have been inexplicably voted off and sent home even before reaching the final 10 , I am not very motivated to watch the show any more. It was a guilty pleasure anyhow.

And btw, y'all, wonder what's with America for voting off the supremely talented and beautiful Asiah, and the always entertaining Rockin' Biker Nurse, anyway? Before the final 10, no less! What, was there confusion over similar unusual names? Some unconscious, self-flagellatory voter preference for the foreign-born over native Americans? (I mean, after all, this is AMERICAN Idol. Don't both Britain and Australia have their own contests????) Maybe the producers uncovered some unsavory personal detail & disguised it as getting voted off? Or, maybe like game shows of yesteryear, the contest is simply rigged.

Regarding why certain folk get votes & others don't, ultimately, I wonder if it wasn't nicely summed up a few yrs ago by comedian/talent show host Arsenio Hall:

"America, you crazy."

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 11:50 AM on 03/26/2008

blueraven [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of blueraven](#) [permalink](#)

The people you're complaining about are either American citizens or have their green cards, so you're sounding just a tad provincial here. And Ireland does NOT participate in Pop Idol. Wrong country.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 05:42 PM on 03/26/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Many countries have their own Idol. I'm not sure what the Idol rules are about flying in from other countries (I ASSUME you have to at least reside in the US) but don't know actually. As for teh show being rigged: absolutely not, for the simple reason that the producers have no reason to rig it. They don't really care because the drama of people staying in and being voted off is unpredictable and that's part of the show's appeal. They just don't care who wins. It all makes good TV drama.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 03:10 AM on 03/27/2008

DemandTruth [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of DemandTruth](#) [permalink](#)

David Cook is my favorite by far! He's the only one who is consistent with his pitch too. Maybe one or two off notes, where others sing whole songs out of key (Brooke - yes Brooke!). That's a pet peeve of mine. I don't consider anyone a decent singer who can't sing on pitch! Anyway, all the rest were boring to bad, but David gives a great performance every time. I'm smitten :)

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 09:41 AM on 03/26/2008

 **Michael Giltz** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Any worries that he needs to change it up? I'm worried people might find it too similar once we get down to the final few. But he's definitely been the most consistent by far the last few weeks.

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 12:45 PM on 03/26/2008](#)

 **scottyboi84** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of scottyboi84](#) [permalink](#)

I have to say that for the third week in a row, i was sad to see kristy lee cook still in the competition whilst better singers than she continue to have their chance at fame. I think if she wasn't a blonde country girl, she would not be so far as she is. Especially last week, when she reigned over Amanda Overmyer. I thought Amanda was a fresh, much needed contestant on American Idol to spice up the usual Idol "types". I am sorry to see her go and Kristy stay.

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 08:27 AM on 03/26/2008](#)

 **Michael Giltz** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

But Kristy sang "God Bless The USA!" I think it's against the LAW to root against Kristy -- at least this week. Amanda was definitely more of a character than Kristy. But neither rocks my world.

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 12:52 PM on 03/26/2008](#)

 **Cate2712** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Cate2712](#) [permalink](#)

I am Australian and I am sorry but Michael does not resemble Heath Ledger, but he may be able to play Michael Hutchens....but there are many here in AUS that would like to do the same. He is amazing though and he can sing. Go QUEEN! He just needs to believe that he is great and amazing and he will get there. I have to say that David Arculeta bores me to tears every week, I find him week and very very boring. Why would you choose such an iconic song for AUS it needs an amazing strong and special voice which he just does not have. I do like Carly I think that she can really sing. One of my fav songs by Bonnie - close to my era. I really enjoyed her rendition and she is beautiful and a great singer. Better than all the other girls that are in the competition and that auditioned. All these kids are a lot younger than me. Michael is the closest to my age. I have to say that David C rendition of Billie Jean was really crap.....and predictable same as every other week but it would have to be the worst he has vomitted out. What the heck were the judges on about.....it was soooooo far from amazing it made me want to go on anti-depressants.....what on earth what they were listening to. Not the same crap that I was I am sure.....

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 08:05 AM on 03/26/2008](#)

 **OBSERVANTMOM** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of OBSERVANTMOM](#) [permalink](#)

I totally agree with you . I hope Michael J goes into acting. There's something about him, he could definitely play Michael Hutchens, I also think he resembles Heath Ledger a bit. His performance was good, I noticed him pull the mike away when he ran out of breath, kudos to him for trying to hide it! This week was kind of boring for me. I ended up fast forwarding through Chikeze, Kristy & Archuleta's songs. For the first time I did not dislike Carly. I've never heard Bonnie Tyler sing that song live but to me Carly sang it the way I would imagine Tyler would sing it, except for that run in the end. I was disappointed with Brooke's performance, I like her and I love Every Breath You Take. I was hoping she would nail it but she just didn't. I agree with the judges, the beginning was great, then it got, not great. Jason was ok but it would have been better if the band had a bigger part in it. Notice how in the recaps at the end of the show, the band was more noticeable. I think since those highlight pieces are of rehearsals and not of what actually aired, Jason made changes to make it more acoustic. Overall my favorite was David C. I just think he's more entertaining and I like the versions of the songs he does, even if they're someone else's versions. It's a nice change for American Idol.

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 03:20 AM on 03/26/2008](#)

 **PBKman** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of PBKman](#) [permalink](#)

I think you are mistaken about the recaps. They are indeed from tonight's show, just like an Instant Replay in a football game.

Go Missouri!!!!

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 10:28 AM on 03/26/2008](#)

 **OBSERVANTMOM** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of OBSERVANTMOM](#) [permalink](#)

I just read recently that the producers of the show said they are from the rehearsals

because they wouldn't be able to put the recaps together so quickly for the end of the live show. I don't remember where I read that, and it might not be true but if you go back & compare, there is a slight difference between the actual performance & the recaps. It might be my mind playing tricks on me but even my husband noticed it.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 10:48 AM on 03/26/2008

[-] **Cate2712** See Profile I'm a Fan of Cate2712 permalink

Oh my you have a lot to say about everyone and do you really know what you are talking about?!?!?!?

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 07:47 AM on 03/26/2008

[-] **OBSERVANTMOM** See Profile I'm a Fan of OBSERVANTMOM permalink

Yes I know what I'm talking about, I'm talking about my thoughts & opinions of the performances last night. Whether you agree with them or not is completely up to you.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 09:47 AM on 03/26/2008

There are More Comments on this Thread. Click Here To See them All

Comments are closed for this entry

You must be [logged in](#) to reply to this comment. [Log in](#) or

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances
Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy
w/the Free Videos Toolbar
Videos.alottoolbars.com



Google™ Custom Search

HOME POLITICS MEDIA BUSINESS ENTERTAINMENT LIVING GREEN STYLE WORLD CHICAGO COMEDY FUNDRACE

[Advertise](#) | [Login](#) | [Make HuffPost your Home Page](#) | [RSS](#) | [Jobs](#) | [FAQ: Comments & Moderation](#) | [FAQ: Huffpost Accounts](#) | [Contact Us](#)

Copyright © 2009 HuffingtonPost.com, Inc. | [Archive](#) | [User Agreement](#) | [Privacy](#) | [Comment Policy](#) | [About Us](#) | [Powered by Movable Type](#)