



APRIL 5, 2009

- HOME
- POLITICS
- MEDIA
- BUSINESS
- ENTERTAINMENT
- LIVING
- STYLE
- GREEN
- WORLD
- CHICAGO
- COMEDY 23/6
- VIDEO
- BLOGGER INDEX
- ARCHIVE
- Twitter: Follow Us
- Get Email Alerts
- Make HuffPost Your HomePage



Madonna Jets Out Of Malawi



More in Entertainment: 'Fast' Rakes In \$72.5M... Madonna Tot's Dad Found... Farrah's Son Arrested...



Farrah Fawcett Is Hospitalized



Michael Giltz

- BIO
- Become a Fan
- Get Email Alerts
- Similar Bloggers

American Idol Top 20: The Results Show

Posted February 29, 2008 | 12:37 AM (EST)

Read More: [American Idol](#), [David Archuleta](#), [Paula Abdul](#), [Pop Music](#), [Randy Jackson](#), [Reality TV](#), [Ryan Seacrest](#), [Simon Cowell](#), [Breaking Entertainment News](#)



Another so-so night for my future as a Jimmy The Greek, but a good night for drama with lots of tears and mysterious subplots. I'm batting .500, which sounds good, or I went 2-4, which sounds...alright. At least no one I thought was safe got sent home.

Seventies Medley -- another godawful Up With People sing-along, though it's always interesting to see who flubs and shines even when all they have is a line or two to sing. On Todd Rundgren's "I Saw The Light," David Archuleta's eyes darted out to the crowd for a brief second when screams exploded but basically maintained his aw-shucks cool. But Danny Noriega has GOT to stop putting one hand behind his back and stretching it across to hold his other arm. Dude, it's totally a tell. On Bonnie Tyler's "It's A Heartache," Amanda Overmyer was just dreadful again, reinforcing my absolute, one hundred percent conviction that she is going home tonight. Is it too late to place a bet? Those songs blended into 10CC's "The Things We Do For Love" and Carole King's "I Feel The Earth Move" (which should have been a home run for Brooke White but wasn't quite). Jason Yeager actually sounded really good and I make a quick second prediction: he's going to improve mightily next week, though never really challenge for the Top 4.

- Email
- Print

Buzz up! Be the First to Submit This Story to Digg

Danny Noriega v Jason Yeager -- Chikezie looked resigned (again) to being eliminated but it came down to these two. Come on, Chikezie, you've got the goods; start to believe in yourself or we never will. Danny looked very blank-faced and stunned (not shocked he was in the bottom two in an obnoxious

way, just trying to brace himself). I quickly guess "Danny" and was of course wrong. Jason is going home, perhaps with the nagging feeling that he never gave the performance he was capable of. A pop career (or a career on Broadway) is nothing but competition in a way but perhaps Jason isn't meant for this type of face-to-face brawl. Why do I say this? Because when he sang "Without You" by the Doobie Brothers, he looked like the weight of the world had been lifted off of him and did it so well I expected the judges to perk up and say, hey, if you'd sung like that on Tuesday you would

Popular Stories on HuffPost

- [Fashion Face-Off! Michelle Obama And Carla Bruni-Sarkozy Finally Meet In France \(VIDEO, PHOTOS, POLL\)](#)
*Video, poll and slideshow
- [Levi Johnston Talks Safe Sex With Tyra Banks \(VIDEO\)](#)
UPDATE 8:30pm: People.com is reporting that Sarah Palin has issued...
- [Oscar de la Renta Slams Michelle Obama's Buckingham Outfit As Major Designers Feel Ignored](#)
While Michelle Obama has made lesser...
- [Verena von Pfetten 7 Lessons To Be Learned From Carla Bruni](#)
So here's the thing. There's no shortage of articles dedicated to that certain je ne...
- [Huff TV Arianna Discusses Michelle Obama's "Fantastic" Style On CBS'](#)

have made it through. Instead, after he was eliminated, Simon was given a chance -- again -- to say he's not very good. What's the point of asking Simon to say something unless he had been supportive of them? Or at least ask Randy or Paula as well so they can give a pat on the back.

Amanda v Alexandra -- Well, the easiest pick of the night since Amanda's performance was an absolute trainwreck. So of course it was...Alexandra who was sent packing. Maybe she was being penalized for wearing a peace symbol earring by Middle America? (I'm joking.) At one point Ryan reached for her arm and she actually stepped back. Please, no touching. Then she sang, also doing a better job than on Wednesday, when it counted. The camera caught David Archuleta seemingly getting a little emotional, turning away and being casually solaced by Michael Johns. Then at the end of the song Alexandra left the stage and gave the now tearful David Archuleta a big hug and then another big hug. Was there a backstage romance or were they just buddies?

Kady Malloy v Alaina Whitaker -- When Ryan asked the ladies in the front row to stand up, they all started muttering. No fun. It came down to these two and my last minute guess (different from my firm prediction of Alaina) was Kady. So of course it was...Alaina who went home. She broke down completely and burst out with, "I can't sing! Sorry, it's embarrassing." I thought she meant in general, but she was freaking out over the goodbye performance. Ryan gave her a very nice pep talk about what an accomplishment it was to get that far. Then he said because she was upset he'd give her a choice and she could sing if she wanted or take a pass if she didn't. Uh, Ryan, it's a live show. If she says she doesn't want to sing, what are you gonna do? Fire her? All the gals crowded around and she gave a creditable performance, again perhaps a better one than on Wednesday. This time it was Danny's turn to cry and tears were streaming down his face. Of course, he was upset -- they were the two funniest people on the show so it's only naturally they'd get along offstage.

We found out that the Beatles catalog -- referred to intentionally as the "Lennon/McCartney songbook" instead of simply as songs by the Beatles (sorry, George) -- was finally released to *Idol* and would be the focus of the first Top 12 night on March 11.

Luke Menard v Robbie Carrico -- When Ryan told the guys to stand up and said the wait was over or something, one of them responded, "We can wait." Robbie sported a totally rockin' skull t-shirt. Even though I'd picked Robbie (and Michael Johns) to go, at the last moment I thought maybe Luke because that falsetto was so goofy. So of course it was...Robbie sent home. (Man, I am on fire tonight! Still I was two for four, picking Robbie and Alaina to go but getting it wrong when I picked Amanda and Michael Johns to join them.) Ryan asked Simon to offer up some comments and Simon again basically said Robbie was a poseur and America knew it. What is the point, I ask again, of asking Simon what he thinks is the future for someone he has said was awful? It just seems mean. Robbie stood there stoically though you know he probably wanted to flash Simon the bird. And the last glimpse of sobbing? A delicate tear or two from Carly Smithson (who sounded really good in the opening medley, by the way -- a first for me in thinking so).

So to wrap up: Goodbye Jason Yeager, Alexandra Lushington, Alaina Whitaker and Robbie Carrico. Also, there's no real point in asking Simon to comment on a performer he's been dissing after they've been eliminated. At the very least, his comments should be balanced by one of the other judges. And when it comes to being eliminated, a boring performance is far more dangerous than an awful one -- especially at this stage with so many people fighting for attention. Amanda Overmyer and Luke Menard and Asia'h Epperson and Michael Johns were, to me, the four worst performers. They're all back next week, while the "what did they sing again?" performances of Robbie and Alaina have sent them home. Were you happy with who got cut? And do you think David and Alexandra like each other or do they LIKE each other?

Email Print

Like this story? Get Alerts of big news events. Enter your email address

More in Entertainment...

SNL: Madonna And Angelina In

Reality Star Jade Goody Buried In

Robert De Niro Nanny Sues For

Alex Da Silva, Celebrity

"Washington Unplugged"

Arianna was on CBS' "Washington..."

Huff TV Arianna Appears on ABC's "This Week" Roundtable With George Stephanopoulos (VIDEO)

Arianna was a guest this morning on...

"BRUNO" TRAILER! Calamity, African Babies, Chase Scenes And More (NSFW VIDEO)

IT'S HERE! The trailer for this July's Sacha Baron Cohen...

NATO Leaders Focus On Afghanistan, But Most Reject Obama's Plea For Troops (SLIDESHOW)

STRASBOURG, France — On the eve of the NATO...

First Lady Fashion At Friday's NATO Concert (PHOTOS)

Another night, another fashion opportunity for NATO leaders and their spouses! See...

Diana Palin, Sarah Palin's Sister-In-Law, Arrested For Breaking Into Home

ANCHORAGE, Alaska — Police say Alaska Gov....

John Oliver Explains The Real Reason You Never Touch The Queen (VIDEO)

John Oliver was upset enough to drop his monocle when he...

Jim Cramer Declares The Depression "Over" (VIDEO)

On Thursday's episode of "Mad Money" host Jim Cramer declared that the depression...

New Jay Leno Show Rejected By NBC Affiliate In Boston

BOSTON — Boston's NBC affiliate says it will air a local newscast instead of...

Ice Bridge Ruptures In Antarctic (VIDEO)

An ice bridge linking a shelf of ice the size of Jamaica to two islands in Antarctica has

Scientists Find Rocket Fuel Chemical In Infant Formula

ATLANTA — Traces of a

Weekend Update...	Lavish...	\$40,000	Choreographer Accused Of...
-------------------	-----------	----------	-----------------------------

digg™ HuffPost Stories Surging Right Now

[Michelle Obama's Clothing Has Sean Hannity All Out Of Sorts](#)

[Cenk Uygur: Have We Reached the Tipping Point on Guns?](#)

[RICHARD POPLAWSKI, Pittsburgh Gunman, Kills 3 Police Officers](#)

[Dr. Rachel Ehrenfeld: Does Iran Harbor Osama bin Laden?](#)

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances
Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy w/the Free Videos Toolbar
Videos.alottoolbars.com



Comments 4 Pending Comments 0

[FAQ: Comments & Moderation](#) [FAQ: HuffPost Accounts](#)

Want to reply to a comment? Hint: Click "Reply" at the bottom of the comment; after being approved your comment will appear directly underneath the comment you replied to

View Comments: [Newest](#) [Expand](#)
[First](#) [All](#)

DemandTruth [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of DemandTruth](#) [permalink](#)

Please, could someone help me here? I've never gotten into the show, but caught a couple performances the last few weeks. Could someone explain to me HOW the singers pick these terribly boring, gawdawful songs!?! Do they pick from a hat? I know they are given the "theme" for the night, right? But do they get assigned an artist then pick a song? And who chooses the key? I know some of these singers have to have decent range, so why do they always sound like they've chosen a key too high or (usually) too low? These songs have been totally boring, tuneless, and many are WAY to difficult for these amateurs to sing. As a classically trained singer myself, it's almost painful to watch!

And how come the judges will sometimes call one performer out for being "pitchy" and sometimes completely ignore it when another sings the whole damn song off key?

Help me out here, somebody!

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 04:56 PM on 02/29/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

The singers are given a list of songs from which they can choose. I've seen the lists mentioned as ranging from 50 to 200 depending on the week, the genre and the outlet reporting on it. Basically, they make certain they've got the rights to a batch of tunes that the band can play and then let the kids choose. The singers have to KNOW what song they're singing early in the process so they have as much time as possible to rehearse and arrange and sometimes change their minds so it's essential there be no question of a clearance problem. So blame the producers when the singers seem to focus again and again on certain songs and artists. They do not pick from a hat and I ASSUME they know what other people

chemical used in rocket fuel were found in samples of...

HUFFPOST'S BIG NEWS PAGES

Computers	India	Barack Obama
Michelle Obama	Sports	Olympics
Housing Crisis	Fox News	Cars

[MORE BIG NEWS PAGES](#)

Books by this author

This Blogger's Books from [amazon.com](#)

A cabin of one's own: New England's MacDowell Colony celebrates 100 years of artistic utopia. And the gay and lesbian artists who prospered there celebrate ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

Affairs to remember: Farley Granger bedded Ava Gardner, Shelley Winters, and Leonard Bernstein. In his autobiography, Include Me Out, Hitchcock's muse ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

[Bloggers Index](#) ▶

[Read All Posts by Michael Giltz](#) ▶

Related News

[Politics](#)
[Levi Johnston Talks Safe Sex With Tyra Banks \(VIDEO\)](#)

[Style](#)
[Michelle Obama Hugs Queen Elizabeth, Stirs Controversy \(PHOTOS, POLL, VIDEO\)](#)

[World](#)
[Obama Breaks Up 'Heated' Spat Between Sarkozy, Hu Jintao](#)

Related Blog Posts

have chosen, but that's never been spelled out to me. The singers can ask for any key they want and have the advice of a staff vocal coach, their own vocal coach if they have one, the band, etc. The judges sometimes ignore a bad performance or accentuate the positive because they either know the person is ill that week (as was the case the last two weeks for a number of artists) but most often because they simply support one artist over others and want to present them in the best possible light because they're most enthusiastic about that person as a talent.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 05:46 PM on 02/29/2008

DemandTruth See Profile I'm a Fan of DemandTruth permalink

Thanks :) So the singers are entirely to blame for picking boring songs by people we've never heard of!? That's good to know. One of my fave shows, Dancing With the Stars - I was shocked to learn they didn't have free reign to pick whatever song they liked (within legal realms that is) - which I shouldn't have been, considering some of the songs! I'm glad to know they let the Idols have more leeway.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 10:39 AM on 03/01/2008

mch755 See Profile I'm a Fan of mch755 permalink

I was kind of surprised the Alexandria was let go, I mean, Amanda was a total disaster, and kinda reinforced it in the group medley. She looked totally out of her element. Alexandria was a good singer, and given the right song would have given a better performance. That hug from her to David A was a sweet thing to do but I don't think had any romantic undertones to it. I read that David competed against Alexandria on Junior Star Seach, so they knew each other from way back. Well as well back as teens can go at least, I think he was 12 and she was 13 when they went head to head. So they probably bonded on the show as friends. As for the guys, Jason was an obvious choice, and I totally agree he sang so much better tonight than on Tuesday. Sorry it was the wrong night. I actually thought he had a good voice but just to schmatzy on the stage. I was surprised Luke wasn't booted, he was dull, but Robbie wasn't that great either. At least my favorites are still around, the 3 Davids, Ramiele and Asiah.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:58 AM on 02/29/2008

Comments are closed for this entry

You must be logged in to reply to this comment. Log in or

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances
Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy
w/the Free Videos Toolbar
Videos.alottoolbars.com



Google Custom Search SEARCH

HOME POLITICS MEDIA BUSINESS ENTERTAINMENT LIVING GREEN STYLE WORLD CHICAGO COMEDY FUNDRACE

Advertise | Login | Make HuffPost your Home Page | RSS | Jobs | FAQ: Comments & Moderation | FAQ: Huffpost Accounts | Contact Us
Copyright © 2009 HuffingtonPost.com, Inc. | Archive | User Agreement | Privacy | Comment Policy | About Us | Powered by Movable Type



Style: Bonnie Fuller
Michelle Obama's Lost Her Mind! 3 Reasons She's Suddenly A Fashion Disaster



Style: Verena von Pfetten
7 Lessons To Be Learned From Carla Bruni



Style: Verena von Pfetten
Brow-O-Wow: Bushy Eyebrows Make A Comeback (PHOTOS, POLL)
Related Tags

- American Idol ▶
- David Archuleta ▶
- Paula Abdul ▶
- Pop Music ▶
- Randy Jackson ▶
- Reality TV ▶
- Ryan Seacrest ▶
- Simon Cowell ▶