



APRIL 5, 2009

THE GOD WHO WASN'T THERE

"Irreverently lays out the case that Jesus Christ never existed."
- Newsweek

"Provocative - to put it mildly."
- Los Angeles Times

DVD BUY NOW >

www.TheGodMovie.com [Feedback - Ads by Google](#)

- HOME
- POLITICS
- MEDIA
- BUSINESS
- ENTERTAINMENT
- LIVING
- STYLE
- GREEN
- WORLD
- CHICAGO
- COMEDY 23/6
- VIDEO
- BLOGGER INDEX
- ARCHIVE
- Twitter: Follow Us
- Get Email Alerts
- Make HuffPost Your HomePage



Madonna Jets Out Of Malawi

More in Entertainment: 'Fast' Rakes In \$72.5M... Madonna Tot's Dad Found... Farrah's Son Arrested...



Farrah Fawcett Is Hospitalized



Michael Giltz

- BIO
- Become a Fan
- Get Email Alerts
- Similar Bloggers

American Idol Top 7: The Results

Posted April 16, 2008 | 02:08 AM (EST)



Read More: [American Idol](#), [Brooke White](#), [Carly Smithson](#), [David Archuleta](#), [David Cook](#), [Fox](#), [Jason Castro](#), [Kristy Lee Cook](#), [Mariah Carey](#), [Paula Abdul](#), [Pop Music](#), [Randy Jackson](#), [Reality TV](#), [Ryan Seacrest](#), [Simon Cowell](#), [Sysha Mercado](#), [Breaking Entertainment News](#)

Buzz up! Be the First to Submit

This Story to Digg

SHARE PRINT COMMENTS

Like this story? Get Alerts of big news events. Enter your email address

HERE'S THE RUNDOWN OF THE RESULTS SHOW:

The gang sang Mariah Carey's massive hit duet with Boyz II Men, "One Sweet Day." And I do mean massive, it was #1 for 16 weeks -- that's four months in a row! NO SONG should ever be played that much. The *Idol* kids frankly made a mess of it; this did no favors to anyone. Later Elliot Yamin (who just lost his mom -- my sympathies) sang "Free" and then Mariah Carey

sang "Bye Bye."

They started splitting the top 7 into two groups. On one side was Jason Castro and Carly Smithson and on the other David Cook and Kristy Lee. At this point, I wrote down, "David Archuleta will go last" because of course everyone knows anyone with the initials "D" and "A" will always be safe so putting him in one group or the other would end the suspense. Again, hats off to Archuleta for never seeming to acknowledge his front-runner status and yet not play it with false modesty either. He just goes with the flow, wisely. Then it became Jason Castro and Carly Smithson and Sysha on one side and David Cook and Kristy Lee Cook and Brooke White on the other. I admit I was a little flummoxed here and wasn't quite sure but just assumed Archuleta would be in David Cook's gang. Then they switched Cook with Sysha (the sneaky bastards) and suddenly it made more sense and clearly Sysha and Kristy Lee and Brooke were the bottom three.

They brought Archuleta out, told him he was safe (brief but not annoying sigh of relief from him -- again, this is a very difficult tightrope he's walking since EVERYONE knew he was safe) and then Ryan told him to choose which group he thought was safe. But Archuleta has been watching this show all his life and he knew enough to pull the old "I'm sitting in the middle" stunt until they made the obvious clear.

Popular Stories on HuffPost

- [Fashion Face-Off! Michelle Obama And Carla Bruni-Sarkozy Finally Meet In France \(VIDEO, PHOTOS, POLL\)](#)
*Video, poll and slideshow
- [Levi Johnston Talks Safe Sex With Tyra Banks \(VIDEO\)](#)
UPDATE 8:30pm: People.com is reporting that Sarah Palin has issued...
- [Oscar de la Renta Slams Michelle Obama's Buckingham Outfit As Major Designers Feel Ignored](#)
While Michelle Obama has made lesser...
- [Verena von Pfetten 7 Lessons To Be Learned From Carla Bruni](#)
So here's the thing. There's no shortage of articles dedicated to that certain je ne...
- [Huff TV Arianna Discusses Michelle Obama's "Fantastic" Style On CBS'](#)

THE BOTTOM THREE -- Syesha and Brooke and Kristy Lee. Any of them could go home. But Syesha was named safe first and she had a HUGE sigh of relief. (This could help to humanize her with the people who think she has too high an opinion of her own talent.) When asked to pick between Kristy and Brooke, Siimon rather politely (I thought) said sorry Kristy, but it's your night finally, sweetheart. Everyone booed and he responded, quite reasonably, "Well, it has to be ONE of them." No wonder he gets the most applause. Kristy boasts that at least she made it into the top 10 which is absolutely right. It's hardly a slam on your talent to make it farther than 100,000+ other folk who auditioned. **Kristy is going home**, Brooke cried (of course) and Kristy sang the first part of "Forever" right to Simon in a cute moment. (It's funny, but Simon likes the attention of speaking out but doesn't really want to be in the spotlight. I can relate, said the blogger.) I was wrong (again) about who was going home but it was perfectly appropriate for Kristy to say bye-bye this week.

AND HERE IS MY ORIGINAL POST ON PERFORMANCE NIGHT FOR MARIAH CAREY WEEK

First, my apologies to Mariah Carey. I thought she would be a disaster as a coach and that a week devoted to her songs would be a mountain of melisma overload. Carey appeared focused and helpful, giving those who seemed receptive very specific suggestions as far as melody, runs, and arrangements. And with only seven songs to hear and most of the kids wisely choosing from her earliest hits, we avoided the recent run of hip-hop influenced songs that have very little melody for other singers to dive into -- they might be good singles, but they don't make good songs. (It's the Grammy distinction between Record of the Year -- ie. best single -- and Song of the Year, ie best standard. Maybe you like her current hit "Touch My Body" as a single but it's not a song that you'd want to hear lots of people sing, unlike, say "Hero.")

Carey by the way has sold 160 million albums worldwide, 62 million of them in the US. (Clearly, she's even bigger overseas. I remember my dad's adult amah/maid in Hong Kong absolutely loved Mariah Carey with the intense devotion only a teenager in America could begin to approach.) And as they mentioned on *Idol*, she just passed Elvis Presley with the most #1 hits by a solo artist and will soon pass the Beatles for the all-time record. Generally dismissed by critics, it's telling that two of the seven songs performed tonight weren't written by her. (I would have sworn someone would tackle the Motown gem "I'll Be There" as well just to avoid her songwriting.) Again, even if you like her music, those high-pitched notes that "sell" them are nigh on impossible to hit.

David Archuleta -- Sings her Oscar-winning song "When You Believe" from the animated film *The Prince of Egypt*. (A duet with Whitney Houston, it was a Top 20 hit written by Broadway's Stephen Schwartz who went on to pen the biggest hit musical of his long career, *Wicked*.) Hilariously, Carey urged Archuleta to go for that falsetto. Though she would prove savvier as the night went on, this was exactly what I expected her to do since Carey LIVES for falsetto. She hoped he would follow her advice, Mariah said modestly, as in, "Boy, you BEST follow my advice." He did. Archuleta was decked out in leather pants for his naughtiest look yet, albeit in service to yet another message-y tune. If ever his diva hands (the inability to sing without gesturing dramatically with your palms) was appropriate, surely Mariah Carey week was it. Archuleta was popping his "p's" very noticeably tonight and the inevitable runs and trills were kind of weak in the lower register and towards the end. Again, this is what I expected on Mariah Carey night: a feeling that the singers were offering two notes for the price of one at every possible juncture. I felt he was fine but not spectacular. Randy raved, giving the first standing ovation of the season, Paula seemed half asleep as she would throughout the night (maybe she was under the weather) but praised him and Simon also said he was great. He also joked after what one imagined was the first of many ballads that we weren't going to have a lot of laughs this week, a joke that went right over sweet little David Archuleta's head. Give the kid points for being a little oblivious to his surroundings: when girls are squealing your name, a casual friendly attitude that quietly acknowledges the pandemonium you're creating is a good approach to not looking falsely modest or too pleased. I thought the judges had over-praised, but on a second listen I up-graded him from pretty good to good. His growl was effective and the runs not as forced as I originally thought.

Carly Smithson -- Sang "Without You," a song made famous by the great singer-songwriter Harry Nilsson, though ironically it was originally written and recorded by Badfinger. (Do buy *Nilsson Sings Newman, Nilsson Schmilsson and his standards album A Little Touch Of Nilsson In The Night* if you want to live a happier life.) Carly was a bit dull at first, though it's always refreshing when people don't over-sing, especially on Mariah Carey week. For me, there's always an unpleasant tension on the high notes from Carly but she scaled the heights in a so-so manner.

"Washington Unplugged"

Arianna was on CBS' "Washington..."

Huff TV Arianna Appears on Panel of ABC's "This Week" With George Stephanopoulos (VIDEO)

Arianna was a panelist this morning on...

"BRUNO" TRAILER! Calamity, African Babies, Chase Scenes And More (NSFW VIDEO)

IT'S HERE! The trailer for this July's Sacha Baron Cohen...

NATO Leaders Focus On Afghanistan, But Most Reject Obama's Plea For Troops (SLIDESHOW)

STRASBOURG, France — On the eve of the NATO...

First Lady Fashion At Friday's NATO Concert (PHOTOS)

Another night, another fashion opportunity for NATO leaders and their spouses! See...

Diana Palin, Sarah Palin's Sister-In-Law, Arrested For Breaking Into Home ANCHORAGE, Alaska — Police say Alaska Gov....

John Oliver Explains The Real Reason You Never Touch The Queen (VIDEO)

John Oliver was upset enough to drop his monocle when he...

Jim Cramer Declares The Depression "Over" (VIDEO)

On Thursday's episode of "Mad Money" host Jim Cramer declared that the depression...

New Jay Leno Show Rejected By NBC Affiliate In Boston

BOSTON — Boston's NBC affiliate says it will air a local newscast instead of...

Scientists Find Rocket Fuel Chemical In Infant Formula

ATLANTA — Traces of a chemical used in rocket fuel were found in samples of...

Ice Bridge Ruptures In Antarctic (VIDEO)

An ice bridge linking a shelf of ice the size of Jamaica to two islands in

She was also dressed nicely, though fans of her ink might not have liked the long sleeves. Randy was non-plussed, Paula mumbled some platitudes and Simon was indifferent.

Syeshia Mercado -- Sang "Vanishing" from Mariah's 9 million selling debut, one of the biggest albums of all time, debut or not. An album track, it wasn't even a single though obviously since it's such a big album, the tune is hardly a rarity, though Simon later acted as if it was. Mariah described Syesha as "very cool" and "composed," and I had the feeling Syesha didn't quite play the gushing fan enough to suit Mariah. Syesha looked smashing, in a sexy adult dress that avoided prom night or cabaret or slutty. Really, the wardrobe people have done a great job this season. Her 'fro was in full force, with some more huge earrings to top it off. And Syesha was sensational. I wrote down "Awesome!" and "Pro!" as she glided through the number with complete confidence. When she had a soulful run tearing into the word "vanishing" Syesha bore down and tilted her body into it and gave the tune her all. Then at the very end she hit a great note while looking back over her shoulder at the camera with a defiant, Diana Ross-like confidence. It reminded me of the heyday of Justin Guarini, who really knew how to work the camera. Clearly, this was her night. Then the judges spoke. Randy thought it was "good" if a little pitchy. Paula was still sleepy but said nice things, and Simon said it was "technically" very very good, but that it did nothing for him. This week, Syesha managed not to look peeved or defiant at their critiques, though I admit they stunned me and probably stunned her as well. What are they listening to when they listen to Syesha? Will one of them come back tomorrow night and say that after listening to the playback they realized they'd missed a great performance? They should. This is the only one of the night I recorded onto DVD and it's a major rebound from last week for her. I hope the voters heard what I heard.

Brooke White -- Sang "Hero," one of Mariah's many #1 hits. Brooke had a good pre-song interview, joking about her tendency to cry, this time over the fact that she missed her sister's wedding. Bizarrely, Brooke said, "She was understanding. She sent me a text. 'I'm glad you're there.'" First, duh -- of course she understands. Brooke is in the middle of a talent contest on the biggest show on TV and if she could get away she would have loved to have been at her sister's wedding. But they only texted each other? You mean Brooke didn't speak to her by cell on her wedding day? That's a little odd. "Hero" was a very good choice for Brooke, proven as soon as she strummed it on her guitar for Mariah. For the performance, she played the piano and it sounded like it fit right into her singer-songwriter wheelhouse, more Carole King (again!) than Mariah Carey. But Brooke tried to get overly soulful in the bridge and then she lost the melody completely, panicked and rushed through the rest of the song, going faster and faster as she approached the end. Randy was mixed. But Paula, who I suspected was tired or a little ill, proved especially perceptive. After insisting that "every ounce of you is totally authentic to who you are," she pointed out that Brooke got a bit lost and flipped out. "Don't ever let that speed you up," she counseled. Simon dropped the hammer on Brooke with an elaborate hamburger metaphor that for some reason I found quite amusing, especially when Randy and Paula insisted Simon was wrong to say it was all bun and no meat and he responded fine, then there was meat but no lettuce or tomato or relish or onion.

Kristy Lee Cook -- Sang "Forever," the first single from the massive hit *Daydream* that DIDN'T hit #1. I was actually scared for Kristy since Mariah Carey week seemed designed to torpedo her. But Mariah insisted she liked Kristy's arrangement of the song better than the one Mariah recorded. (At least, I assume Mariah was referring to the arrangement and not Kristy's actual vocals, no offense Miss Cook.) It's a very weird sort of performance, with Kristy diving into the second line so abruptly I thought she'd messed up or forgotten the words for a moment but she did it consistently again and again every time she got to those lines. It was very draggy and rough when not just odd and surely the first time Mariah has been covered with a steel guitar. Kristy looked great, but at the end there was a weird close-up of her that turned out to be a camera focused on one of the video monitors in the auditorium -- something we realized as the song was finishing and the camera began to pull back from the monitor and we realized that Kristy was actually far away on the stage. Even more than the simple step of ending with the camera far far away from the singer (which dampens any emotional finale), this was a very distracting, cold technique that could subliminally hurt her. Randy was indifferent. Paula vehemently disagreed and said Kristy was great and happily suggested Kristy was diabolically pretending not to be a very good singer in the past so she could keep improving and sneak up on everyone. Simon was nonplussed. I think they're just waiting for her to get eliminated and have nothing to say. That was four women in a row, by the way, when the more obvious arrangement would have been girl-boy-girl-boy-girl-boy-girl. I



HUFFPOST'S BIG NEWS PAGES

Computers	India	Barack Obama
Michelle Obama	Sports	Olympics
Housing Crisis	Fox News	Cars

[MORE BIG NEWS PAGES](#)

Books by this author

This Blogger's Books from [amazon.com](#).

A cabin of one's own: New England's MacDowell Colony celebrates 100 years of artistic utopia. And the gay and lesbian artists who prospered there celebrate ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

Affairs to remember: Farley Granger bedded Ava Gardner, Shelley Winters, and Leonard Bernstein. In his autobiography, Include Me Out, Hitchcock's muse ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

Related Tags

American Idol, Brooke White, Carly Smithson, David Archuleta, David Cook, FOX, Jason Castro, Kristy Lee Cook, Mariah Carey, Paula Abdul, Pop Music, Randy Jackson, Reality TV, Ryan Seacrest, Simon Cowell, Syesha Mercado

wonder why they did it this way, unless it's the simple fact that the men are much stronger and so the show works better musically by beginning and ending with them.

David Cook -- Sang "Always Be My Baby," also from the 9 million selling hit *Daydream*. Cook naturally gave it the moody rocker makeover (or "Cookified" it, as I like to say) and Mariah seemed to dig it. It was a bit awkward at the beginning, with Cook's lower register having little personality. I was waiting and waiting for it to kick in till finally it did. He definitely got better as he went along and was quite strong in the middle and a decent if not great ending (it sounded better on a second listen than I originally thought). News reports said Cook's very ill brother would be in attendance and we got a quick glimpse of him at the end as they flashed on his friends and family. Classily, it wasn't mentioned either before or after the performance. Randy raved, Paula raved (adding what I imagine she considered the high high compliment of "That song could be on a movie soundtrack right now!") and Simon raved too. Cook was clearly feeling the emotions of the moment, they cut to a close-up, Ryan pointed out the obvious (that cook was tearing up) and then the producers got even more cloying by cutting to his brother again. Cook behaved graciously but the show didn't.

Jason Castro -- Sang "I Don't Wanna Cry," the fourth #1 hit from Mariah's debut. Rudely, I'll point out again that two of the songs weren't written by Mariah and that of the other five, the most recent is from 12 years ago. Mariah said he was interesting and different and if he chose to do any of the little ideas she offered it could be really good. So I'm not sure what was going on there -- one thing is clear, Jason knows exactly who he is and what works for him. But his arrangement didn't seem to take any dramatic license from the original (which had an acoustic Spanish guitar-like run of some sort in it) and he seemed to deliver the vocal run she suggested. In any case, it was another winning performance with charm and confidence making up for his lack of vocals. You don't need a great voice if you make great choices (Jimmy Durante, anyone?), even if you do sing out of the side of your mouth. Randy was very negative, insisting it sounded like some Hawaiian luau, which he meant as an insult. Simon was utterly confused and said he had no idea what a luau was. (He really does have some of the most interesting gaps of knowledge. Who hasn't heard of a luau?) Paula retorted that she'd LOVE to be at that luau listening to Castro all night long and in this case I agree with her. Significantly, she also zeroed in on his strong suit: confidence. She may have been sleepy tonight, but she was paying attention. Simon was also very laudatory.

Bottom Three -- I think all three men are completely safe this week, especially since the only negative comment about any of them was Randy's luau diss of Jason Castro. With more women, the bottom three will come from them. I have to believe the audience heard what I heard from Syesha so I'm hoping the bottom three is Carly, Kristy and Brooke. Kristy was the most forgettable and Brooke the most disastrous. Carly wasn't very good either and she did go second, but might benefit from the very wide appeal of her song "Without You." That leaves Kristy and Brooke in the bottom two. Kristy was given the worst presentation by the producers but Simon really dropped the hammer on Brooke (who again couldn't keep from talking while the judges critiqued her). I think Brooke is going home in a very tight vote.

Who did you like and who do you think is going home?

More in Entertainment...

"Family Guy," "American Dad" Men Talk Hillary...	SNL: Madonna And Angelina In Weekend Update...	Reality Star Jade Goody Buried In Lavish...	Robert De Niro Nanny Sues For \$40,000
--	--	---	--

digg™ HuffPost Stories Surging Right Now

[Michelle Obama's Clothing Has Sean Hannity All Out Of Sorts](#)

[Cenk Uygur: Have We Reached the Tipping Point on Guns?](#)

[RICHARD POPLAWSKI, Pittsburgh Gunman, Kills 3 Police Officers](#)

[Dr. Rachel Ehrenfeld: Does Iran Harbor Osama bin Laden?](#)

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances
 Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy
 w/the Free Videos Toolbar
Videos.alottoolbars.com



Comments

24

Pending Comments

0

[FAQ: Comments & Moderation](#)

[FAQ: HuffPost Accounts](#)

Want to reply to a comment? Hint: Click "Reply" at the bottom of the comment; after being approved your comment will appear directly underneath the comment you replied to

View Comments: Newest Expand
First All

Page: 1 [2](#) [Next](#) [Last](#) » (2 pages total)

[-](#) **WomanInOrangeSweater** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of WomanInOrangeSweater](#) [permalink](#)

Randy did not give David A the first standing ovation of the season. That went to David Cook. Does anyone proof this stuff?

[♥ Favorite](#) [🚩 Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 11:15 AM on 04/19/2008](#)

[-](#) **auramac** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of auramac](#) [permalink](#)

Brooke- on iTunes, of course!...

[♥ Favorite](#) [🚩 Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 03:02 AM on 04/19/2008](#)

[-](#) **auramac** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of auramac](#) [permalink](#)

I too was a bit disappointment in my favorite singer- Brooke. For those who agreed with Simon that there was no beef on her piano buns- check out the studio recording she did of the same song- this time accompanied by guitar. And it sounds so good you'd never know it was a Mariah Carey song. It's beautiful, and I paid for it! She's even better than I thought! I want more! Seriously- go check it out.

[♥ Favorite](#) [🚩 Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 03:01 AM on 04/19/2008](#)

[-](#) **CowgirlAmy** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of CowgirlAmy](#) [permalink](#)

Mariah has not sold 160 million albums worldwide. She has sold 160 million albums and singles combined. That number is deceiving. Celine Dion and Madonna have both sold more albums than her by far as both of them are far far more successful than Mariah, worldwide. Madonna has sold 325 million albums plus singles.

[♥ Favorite](#) [🚩 Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 03:50 PM on 04/17/2008](#)

[-](#) **MercedesGabiella** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of MercedesGabiella](#) [permalink](#)

In defense of Simon, most Americans know what a luau is only because Hawaii is a US state. In Europe, Hawaiian mores are largely unknown.

[♥ Favorite](#) [🚩 Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 09:41 AM on 04/17/2008](#)

[-](#) **Michael Giltz** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

I thought the luau was more universally known, like a Japanese tea ceremony or a Brazilian samba and so on. I'm British too, but I live in New York City so I've got that advantage. Obviously you're right, as Simon demonstrated. Next time I'm in Europe, I'll make that my pet question: do you know what a luau is? Thanks for writing.

[♥ Favorite](#) [🚩 Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 11:23 AM on 04/17/2008](#)

[-](#) **mch755** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of mch755](#) [permalink](#)

I also was surprised that Mariah seemed coherent and helpful. I fully expected a Paula in Training babble fest but thankfully it didn't happen. Overall the singers did a pretty good job singing songs I thought would be a trainwreck of a night. Here's my rankings:
 1. David Cook- even though he wasn't spot on, his emotional strength came thru and I really liked this a

lot. The only one I'll buy on iTunes. Maybe he did get a pass from the judges due to his brother's condition but who cares he sang well and he deserved the praise. I also like the guy more since he doesn't trot out the sympathy card.

2. Kristy Lee- I know alot of folks didn't like her singing but I felt she did a good job. I actually voted for her.

3. David A- I don't know where this kid gets all this loving from the judges, I wasn't that impressed with the singing and I forgot what he sang when he finished. But I do remember he sang well compared to the last 4 singers.

4. Syesha/Carly/Jason- I grouped these three together, none of them really did anything for me. I could also barely hear Jason at times. Carly did look good, at least covering the tats for once.

5. Brooke- snoozeville.....plus she messed up the song.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:23 AM on 04/17/2008

Libsrule [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Libsrule](#) [permalink](#)

Well once again I'm commenting about a show I really don't like that much but my comments Michael (and you KNOW I love your reviews) are the following:

It's PASSED not PAST.

And as far as outselling, I have to take it into the context of the times. IF the Beatles just hit the gate today with the same results as they once did, then their records would probably be in the BILLION range. One has got to look at how marketing, and reach are conducted today vs "yesterday"(sorry I couldn't resist) not to mention the wide demographics out there vs the limited ones back in the day. Back then the only people making The Beatles popular were simply the young teenagers and some college aged young ones. Today's listeners have been brought up more accepting of new music and that extends to grandmothers and fathers as opposed to 1964 when no "decent adult" would listen to either one.

And as far as talent goes, well Ms Carey may be popular but let's be honest, Elvis and especially The Beatles have/had more talent in their little toes than Ms. Carey will have in her entire lifetime and beyond.

BUT for the AI stuff. I still can't handle it Michael. I really can't. It just seems so shallow even by Hollywood "standards". BUT I am glad you are enjoying it and I can read about instead of having to watch it.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 12:19 AM on 04/17/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Libsrule, thanks for the copyediting -- I've changed it. My mind must have slipped for a moment (that's what happens when you post at 2 in the morning). Mariah Carey has amassed more #1s than Elvis but the #1 is a much easier spot to hit these days for countless reasons. Times always change so it's hard to compare different eras. Suffice to say that Elvis and the Beatles were massively successful in their day chart-wise. But as for sales, despite that 160 mil, Carey still has a long way to go to match the Beatles and Elvis worldwide (though God help us at this rate she might). Elvis has sold perhaps 1 billion albums and singles worldwide, though that includes singles which the Carey 160 mil total does not. The Beatles are also roundly estimated to have sold one billion albums and singles worldwide. As for talent, no one equals the Beatles as a band and few can match Elvis. Couldn't agree with you more. And if my roundup lets you stay informed without having to actually watch the darn thing, then I've achieved my goal. Now if only I could sing outside the shower.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:24 AM on 04/17/2008

Charity [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Charity](#) [permalink](#)

jason has no singing voice. he is the sanjaya of this season, though much more likeable and really knows how to work "authentic." just like brooke knows how to work "authentic.". like the saying goes "all you need is sincerity and when you can fake that, you've got it made. et tu, jason and brooke.

i still fail to understand why the hate for syesha. she's not the best singer in all of AI history but she in no way deserves the constant negativity heaped on her by the judges, especially simon. she sings rings around jason and brooke, gives carly a go for her money, and is far more palatable than david cook.

ah, david cook. sorry to hear about his brother, but cook just doesn't cut it for me. however, that being said, i'm sure he has a nice career ahead of him screeching his way through rock history on the heels of other's arrangements.

carly is a fine belter of a singer. and as a side note here - in miami, "without you" sung by harry nilsson was a huge hit. i barely remember the badfinger version. i was a nilsson fan from the early days, btw,

so my memory is only of the version by the man himself.

kristy did okay, and i was actually kind of surprised as to how she hangs in there.

as for david a.: the best.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 07:20 PM on 04/16/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Thanks for reading, Charity. You're absolutely right about "Without You." it was only an album track for Badfinger and didn't chart for them. But it was a massive smash in Miami (I grew up in Ft. Lauderdale, by the way) and all around the country, staying at #1 for four weeks, by far the biggest hit of his career. His other big hit? "Everybody's Talkin'" after being used in Midnight Cowboy, another song Nilsson didn't write. Ironic since he wrote such great songs, like "One" which became a hit for others. I suppose Jason really is a far more palatable Sanjaya, with the key difference that despite his lack of vocal skills, I wouldn't mind hanging out while he strummed a guitar and sang a tune or two. Not true of Sanjaya. Your other comments are spot on as well.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:29 AM on 04/17/2008

67bug [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of 67bug](#) [permalink](#)

God, they were such boring songs. I don't know what the big deal is about Mariah, I'm so happy that I grew up listening to Grace Slick and Janis Joplin. Guess it's all about the almighty dollar.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 04:55 PM on 04/16/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Imagine a Grace Slick week. Who could tackle "White Rabbit?" Both great talents, of course, though Janis Jolin's legacy of a few albums doesn't begin to match what she might have done.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:31 AM on 04/17/2008

epotruchyeahright [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of epotruchyeahright](#) [permalink](#)

Part Three

6. David C. " I actually did NOT like this arrangement of "Always Be My Baby." David's pitch wobbled frequently in the lower registers throughout. It was a daring arrangement, and Blake Lewis's take on Bon Jovi's "You Give Love a Bad Name" already proved that risk-taking is prized. I didn't go back and listen again, but perhaps I'll do it tonight before the results show. Of course he's safe.

7. Jason " After last week's "Somewhere Over the Rainbow" success, I think Jason is going to be a huge star. His version of "I Don't Wanna Cry" was more of what makes him so unique, and provides insight into how he'd show up as a songwriter. He seemed so much more comfortable in the last two weeks than I've ever seen him. I predicted he'd go out next week, but I am withdrawing that prediction. Here's my predictions now:

7. Brooke White
6. Kristy Lee Cook
5. Carly Smithson
4. Syesha Mercado
3. Jason Castro
2. David Cook
1. David Archuleta

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:09 PM on 04/16/2008

Michael Giltz [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Thanks for your analysis. I wouldn't be at all surprised if it were an all male final three. It seems far more likely the women will fall. You're right, Archuleta is still a boy, but he's a cute kid and there's every reason to think he'll be a good-looking man since he's past puberty already. I hated Brooke's pouty face as well during the critiques. I agree wholeheartedly about Cook this week -- I was really surprised the judges had no complaints. And Jason is certainly doing everything right. Never on Idol has someone gone so far on sheer saviness. Let's see how your predictions turn out, especially the all-male top three. You could be right.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:36 AM on 04/17/2008

epotruchyeahright [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of epotruchyeahright](#) [permalink](#)

Part Two

3. Syesha -- Technically a beautiful rendition of Vanishing, one of my favorite Mariah tunes from the

first album. I had predicted that she'd stumble this week and get eliminated, but now I'm not so sure. Her biggest problem is that she thinks she's better than she actually is, as in she attempts these songs to prove to America that she's as good as Whitney or Mariah or Celine. As Simon said, she's just not that good. Still she was better than

4. Brooke -- Total disaster with "Hero." I had to close my eyes when she performed. Her rushing started earlier than when others have said. Her pitch was all over the place. I'm a little tired of the nasally honk that escapes her mouth so often when she sings. It's a fine affectation once in a while, but she seems to overplay it. I also am tired of her not standing there quietly when the judges are talking, even if she's being polite by saying "Thank you." Hated her pouty face after Simon's burger/bun analogy.

5. Kristy " Actually liked this performance of "Forever." She's gorgeous, she's likeable, and her slight country lilt in this arrangement was just the right touch. She'll probably be in the bottom three, but safe. (part three to come)

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:08 PM on 04/16/2008

epotruchyeahright See Profile I'm a Fan of epotruchyeahright [permalink](#)

Thought Mariah week would be a disaster; she's such a diva. To my great surprise, I think she provided some of the most cogent, musical support from any mentor since David Foster in Season 5. She listened, she suggested, she complimented, and she was fair in her assessments (although I don't think she or the producers would have had her say anything too negative).

1. David A. -- the LA Times blogger calls him "The Chosen One" and he lives up to that name every week. Song and presentation were great. My only critique, and probably what makes him so endearing to young girls, is that he doesn't look like a star -- yet. His physical presence is nerdy, like someone who hasn't quite discovered what his body can do. It's almost as if he hasn't discovered he has a penis yet. And it might be true, at least figuratively, since he hasn't yet sung one song that was about romantic love.

2. Carly " She sang "Without You," the Badfinger classic. I love her voice, but I actually think she should stop trying to hit the glory notes too often. Not only do they sound "shriek-y," as Simon has often said, but they detract from her smooth style. The nature of the competition makes her do it week after week, but once she enters the pop world again as a solo artist, she should sheath that sword and bring it out more sparingly for better effect. (part two to

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 02:07 PM on 04/16/2008

strummerfan See Profile I'm a Fan of strummerfan [permalink](#)

I have stopped counting Paula as a judge, since she says very little of actual value and mutters incoherently a lot of the time.

While I agree with the general assessment that David Cook's lower register needs some work, I don't seem to really care it's not always perfect. I loved his performance last night. I've loved nearly every performance he's given (last week was not pretty, but I can forgive).

As for the rest, I like Jason Castro and I can understand (via my ten year old daughter) the appeal of David A. The girls are a mystery to me. Carly has a good voice, but I can't figure out what it is about her that is annoying me so much. Syesha has a good voice, but I always seem to forget she's there until someone tells me she was. Kristy can't sing all that well, but looks pretty on stage. Brooke- I think she could have a nice little career, but I don't see her lasting much longer on the show.

An all David final two, unless something goes horribly wrong for one of them, with Jason Castro coming third. The girls will all be eliminated in the next month. Which is sad.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:35 PM on 04/16/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz [permalink](#)

Paula is a cheerleader more than a judge, of course. I agree with the all-David finale being highly likely and the three guys in the final three. Sorry gals.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:38 AM on 04/17/2008

JamieFrevele See Profile I'm a Fan of JamieFrevele [permalink](#)

As obsessed as I was with Mariah as a 13-year old, I was just not feeling this week at all. Maybe I'm still mourning the loss of Michael Johns from the competition, knowing that Kristy Lee Cook and Jason Castro are still in it. But I was looking forward to the recap. And if Carly covered her tattoos because of the complaints by the squares, that makes me sad. I would like to see Kristy Lazarus Cook go. Lackluster to the max, which is kind of an oxymoron.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:27 PM on 04/16/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz [permalink](#)

No, not an oxymoron -- lackluster to the max is a great description!

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 01:38 AM on 04/17/2008

Musicated See Profile I'm a Fan of Musicated permalink

David Archuletta: I agree with Michael on Mariah Carey night. I thought it had disaster written all over it and, to my surprise, she actually got Archuletta to find that falsetto, something I'd been wondering why he hadn't used earlier in spots. Still, she's the Mistress of Melisma and, in my opinion, an historically bad influence on modern pop singing. Forget the Alamo, remember the Melody!!

Carly Smithson: So close and yet so far. The first half of the song was unforced and very effective and then, as always, she 'deep sixed' it by pushing way too hard.

Syesha Mercado: Ditto the above...very, very nice and then she screamed her way through the end of the song. What a snore. To do what she wanted to do necessitates the tools.

Brooke White: Please, please, not another week of that weak stuff. I really couldn't be more alienated by bad singing and that pouty affect during the judges critique. Please stop talking and check on the kids.

Kristy Lee Cook: Brooke White is starting to make Kristy look like Mahalia Jackson.

David Cook: Really not his best and his usually spot-on intonation was in complete disarray through all of the early parts in his lower register. Extreme over praise from the judges out of sympathy?

Jason Castro: Give him credit...as one of the contestants who should have suffered the most from Mariah night, he pulled a rabbit out of the hat. Principally, it was engaging and confident.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 10:20 AM on 04/16/2008

Page: 1 2 Next Last » (2 pages total)

Comments are closed for this entry

You must be logged in to reply to this comment. Log in or

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances
Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy
w/the Free Videos Toolbar
Videos.alottoolbars.com



Google Custom Search SEARCH

HOME POLITICS MEDIA BUSINESS ENTERTAINMENT LIVING GREEN STYLE WORLD CHICAGO COMEDY FUNDRAISE

Advertise | Login | Make HuffPost your Home Page | RSS | Jobs | FAQ: Comments & Moderation | FAQ: Huffpost Accounts | Contact Us

Copyright © 2009 HuffingtonPost.com, Inc. | Archive | User Agreement | Privacy | Comment Policy | About Us | Powered by Movable Type