

Madonna Jets Out Of Malawi

More in Entertainment: 'Fast' Rakes In \$72.5M... Madonna Tot's Dad Found... Farrah's Son Arrested...

Farrah Fawcett Is Hospitalized



Michael Giltz

BIO Become a Fan Get Email Alerts Similar Bloggers

American Idol Top 9: The Results

Posted April 2, 2008 | 01:54 AM (EST)

Read More: [American Idol](#), [Best Little Whorehouse In Texas](#), [Broadway](#), [Brooke White](#), [Carly Smithson](#), [Country Music](#), [David Archuleta](#), [David Cook](#), [Dolly Parton](#), [Fox](#), [Jason Castro](#), [Kevin Costner](#). [The Bodyguard](#), [Kristy Lee Cook](#), [Michael Johns](#), [Movies](#), [Paula Abdul](#), [Pop Music](#), [Ramiele Malubay](#), [Randy Jackson](#), [Reality TV](#), [Ryan Seacrest](#), [Simon Cowell](#), [Sysha Mercado](#), [Whitney Houston](#), [Breaking Entertainment News](#)

MEIL YOUNG
 FORK IN THE ROAD
 HIS LATEST ALBUM FEATURES 10 NEW SONGS

AVAILABLE
 APRIL 7

CLICK HERE TO EXPERIENCE THE ALBUM
 NEILYOUNG.COM

Popular Stories on HuffPost

- [Fashion Face-Off! Michelle Obama And Carla Bruni-Sarkozy Finally Meet In France \(VIDEO, PHOTOS, POLL\)](#)
*Video, poll and slideshow
- [Levi Johnston Talks Safe Sex With Tyra Banks \(VIDEO\)](#)
UPDATE 8:30pm: People.com is reporting that Sarah Palin has issued...
- [Oscar de la Renta Slams Michelle Obama's Buckingham Outfit As Major Designers Feel Ignored](#)
While Michelle Obama has made lesser...
- [Verena von Pfetten 7 Lessons To Be Learned From Carla Bruni](#)
So here's the thing. There's no shortage of articles dedicated to that certain je ne...
- [Huff TV Arianna Discusses Michelle Obama's 'Fantastic' Style On CBS'](#)

Buzz up! Be the First to Submit This Story to Digg

SHARE PRINT COMMENTS

UPDATE: THE RESULTS SHOW:
 The gang sings along to **Dolly Parton's** classic "9 to 5." That hit film is **coming to Broadway in spring of 2009**, which should give Dolly another chance

to score with that project. I'd say she was robbed when she lost the Oscar to "Fame." But frankly Willie Nelson's "On The Road Again" from *Honeysuckle Rose* would have been just as deserving as Dolly's tune. But proof of the tune's durability is that this is the least tiresome sing-along in memory.

Ryan puts the obvious people on the sofa early on, including Michael Johns, David Archuleta and Carly Smithson. Then, God help us, they take more phone calls. This episode-padding bit of desperation reaches a new low in boredom with virtually none of the questions being provocative and everyone showing how bored they are by giving answers just as dull as the questions.

Clark Brothers -- This group of brothers won *The Next Great American Band* competition and thank goodness -- they were my favorites from day one, along with that heavy metal group of teen and pre-teen rockers. The Clark Brothers tear through "This Little Light Of Mine," a signature tune of theirs and I loved it. But shouldn't they have covered a Dolly Parton song? It certainly wouldn't have been a stretch given their bluegrass/gospel roots.

David Cook is also safe and pooh-poohs the news reports of **his medical emergency**. The fact that he's never mentioned his ailing brother on camera the way so many other contestants trot out ailing family members and friends makes me like him even more. Finally, Ramiele and Kristy Lee Cook join the bottom three. When Sysha is called next, both Jason Castro and Brooke White look very anxious backstage since they know one of them will be in the lowest rung. Brooke is the one while Jason is safe and we get a glimpse of his very good-looking friends in the audience.

Dolly Parton -- She sings "Jesus and Gravity" from her **new album *Backwoods Barbie***. After a string of critically acclaimed bluegrass albums, Dolly's aimed right for the heart of country radio

with this CD. Between this and the Clark Brothers tune of an old spiritual standard, Idol is setting a record for references to Jesus and God. (Hey, they should do a gospel night one season.) To be honest, Dolly's performance isn't great. But she's a hoot once it's over, shouting out "Hallelujah, Simon, how are ya?" and later saying, "Simon tells the truth; someone's got to do it."

The Bottom Three -- so roomies Ramiele, Brooke White and Kristy Lee Cook are in the bottom three. Brooke is safe and then -- as I and many others predicted -- **Ramiele finally says goodbye.** The only surprise is that it didn't happen sooner, but she does as good a job as she can singing at the end and can look forward to the Idol tour.

HERE'S MY COVERAGE OF THE PERFORMANCE NIGHT WITH DOLLY PARTON

It's Dolly Parton night on *American Idol* and don't we all have a big goofy smile on our faces? Dolly Parton is one of the most talented songwriters in country music history, has a sensational voice and has recorded more great albums than you can shake a stick at. Plus she's a good actress and will probably conquer Broadway with her musical version of *9 to 5* coming out this fall or next year. It must be fun going through life and knowing that every time you walk into a room of strangers that their faces light up with delight.

Brooke White -- She sings "Jolene." Dolly is seen mentoring her and it becomes clear Dolly fits in the "cheerleader" genre of mentors, people who smile and encourage you but aren't seen really digging in and shaping their singing or overall performances. (No one has equaled Barry Manilow as a mentor in my book -- he changed the keys they sang in, worked on their arrangements and really made them better.) But who wouldn't want encouragement from Dolly? Last week, Brooke failed to realize that "Every Breath You Take" is a tune about a jealous lover on the verge of becoming a stalker. Tonight she bounced happily through a tune about a woman desperately pleading with a femme fatale to leave her man alone. Randy was mixed, Paula rambled on before insisting, "You are...Brooke White" to which Simon chimed in "Yes, she is!" Simon rightly said the song showed no emotion and Brooke as always responded to every negative comment with, "OK, OK, that's alright."

David Cook -- He sang "Little Sparrow" all while growing a goatee apparently. Dolly said that "he doesn't mind reaching for it" which is a compliment about pushing your voice but really a comment about the limitations of said voice. She said polite things to David and he bowed to her! Please don't bow anymore David. His performance was solid and most notable for breaking the emo-rocker moody midtempo mold that Cook had fallen into. Instead of ending with a big rock flourish he ended with a quiet little instrumental run. All three judges were positive, with Simon insulting Dolly by saying if David can make a song about sparrows sound good, then he must really be good. (On Beatles night, Simon mocked Paul McCartney's "Blackbird." Maybe he just hates birds.

Ramiele Malubay -- She sang "Do I Ever Cross Your Mind" when I was certain Ramiele would tackle "9 to 5." "Finally, someone my size!" Dolly joked to Ramiele, who was clearly overwhelmed by meeting her. Ramiele bounced through the tune with pluck, despite being flat or off and hitting several bum notes at the finale when her voice wavered. Flavorless, bland. Randy was negative, Paula said "I'm proud of you" which is her way of being negative and Simon correctly described it as something you'd hear on a cruise ship.

Jason Castro -- He sang "Travellin' Through," the theme song from 2005's *Transamerica*. Castro is always amiable despite a voice that practically disappears while he was singing. The copious references to God and Jesus might win him a few extra votes from heartland Christians who don't realize the movie is about the dignity of transgendered people. (**Dolly was robbed of an Oscar** when her song lost to the far inferior tune "It's Hard Out Here For A Pimp" from Hustle & Flow.) hilariously, **Jason messes up the words.** Instead of the couplet "'Im out here on my journey, trying to make the most of it/ I'm a puzzle, I must figure out where all my pieces fit" he sings "I'm a puzzle, I must figure out why I'm a piece of sh--" and then slurs the last word when he realizes something has gone horribly wrong. None of the judges comment on his live almost-cursing moment (maybe they thought Dolly had gone ghetto) but only Paula found something nice to say.

Carly Smithson -- She sang "Here You Come Again," one of Dolly's signature songs even though it was written by Mann and Weill. (Unlike my friend Aaron, I see nothing wrong with the kids choosing a song associated with Dolly even if it isn't one of the 3000 she wrote herself.) I liked the quiet, slow approach to a tune that's usually more upbeat and thought Smithson did a very good

["Washington Unplugged"](#)

Arianna was on CBS' "Washington..."

[Huff TV Arianna Appears on ABC's "This Week" Roundtable With George Stephanopoulos \(VIDEO\)](#)

Arianna was a guest this morning on...

["BRUNO" TRAILER! Calamity, African Babies, Chase Scenes And More \(NSFW VIDEO\)](#)

IT'S HERE! The trailer for this July's Sacha Baron Cohen...

[NATO Leaders Focus On Afghanistan, But Most Reject Obama's Plea For Troops \(SLIDESHOW\)](#)

STRASBOURG, France — On the eve of the NATO...

[First Lady Fashion At Friday's NATO Concert \(PHOTOS\)](#)

Another night, another fashion opportunity for NATO leaders and their spouses! See...

[Diana Palin, Sarah Palin's Sister-In-Law, Arrested For Breaking Into Home](#)

ANCHORAGE, Alaska — Police say Alaska Gov....

[John Oliver Explains The Real Reason You Never Touch The Queen \(VIDEO\)](#)

John Oliver was upset enough to drop his monocle when he...

[Jim Cramer Declares The Depression "Over" \(VIDEO\)](#)

On Thursday's episode of "Mad Money" host Jim Cramer declared that the depression...

[New Jay Leno Show Rejected By NBC Affiliate In Boston](#)

BOSTON — Boston's NBC affiliate says it will air a local newscast instead of...

[Scientists Find Rocket Fuel Chemical In Infant Formula](#)

ATLANTA — Traces of a chemical used in rocket fuel were found in samples of...

[Ice Bridge Ruptures In Antarctic \(VIDEO\)](#)

An ice bridge linking a shelf of ice the size of

job until the end, where she indulged in her usual unnecessary runs and trills. Randy gave the most lackluster endorsement possible. Even though she was the fifth of only nine performers, Randy could only manage to say "I do believe that will probably be one of the better ones of the night." Whew, knock yourself out. Paula of course was nice and Simon was quite negative. I disagreed with him and I haven't been a fan of hers. But it was tiresome to see Ryan asking, basically, "What's your problem?" Simon's problem is just the singing and the fact that he gets the loudest applause of any of the judges should let Ryan know Simon is doing something right.

David Archuleta -- He sang "Smokey Mountain Memories." I worried that a 17 year old would be at a disadvantage since he simply wouldn't know as many older tunes as the other singers and would therefore have a much steeper learning curve to overcome. What do I know, since he's plucked "You're The Voice" out of obscurity last week and this week tackles this Dolly tune like it's an old friend. Dolly really only praised two performers and he was one of them. She seemed to almost tear up during rehearsals and said, "I really think that he has the voice to really become a great, great singer." And then he stepped out and did an admirable job with a song I imagine was not so familiar to most of the people in the audience, though it was right in his comfort zone of quietly inspirational ballads. He was a little breathy and lost his breath completely at the end of one line and still has that problem of diva hands to overcome (his tendency to gesture repeatedly with his hands like some old soul singer). But it was very, very good. His best moment was when David started to tackle the big final notes of the tune and the camera was behind him looking over his shoulder and into the mosh pit. We got a good look at about four or five girls who were gazing up at David with pure, unadulterated adulation. All three judges raved.

Kristy Lee Cook - She sang "Coat of Many Colors," perhaps the quintessential Dolly Parton song and did it in a great, country-ish dress and no shoes. Dolly hugged her at the end of rehearsals and said, "Your mom's going to be so proud," which she meant sweetly but which Kristy rightly pegged as deflating. It's not exactly "wow, you own that song!" is it? She got through it just fine with Randy and Paula being overly nice. Simon nailed it when he said "pleasant but unforgettable." Still, she looked terrific and this is her genre and Middle America loves this song.

Sysha Mercado -- She sang "I Will Always Love You" and who else other than Carly Smithson could have tackled it? Actually, Brooke White could have tackled it if she stuck to Dolly's original plaintive version (which was a massive hit for Dolly and then a massive hit again when she recorded it again for the movie *Best Little Whorehouse In Texas* and then a massive hit for the ages when Whitney Houston pummeled it into submission for *The Bodyguard* with Kevin Costner reportedly suggesting she record the tune and even offering up his idea for the arrangement that would have her singing a capella for the first verse of the tune). Anyway, Dolly seemed oh so slightly peeved that Sysha did most of the tune her way but then inevitably went the Whitney route for the end since the Whitney version is tailor-made for *Idol* viewers who love their big notes. Sysha looked just lovely in a yellow dress, perched on a piano and sang the tune wonderfully. In the last 30 seconds, she switched from sensitive to diva and sang the heck out of it, hitting that big note triumphantly and doing a generally smash-up job. To my surprise, the judges weren't wildly enthusiastic. Randy was mixed, Paula nice and Simon thought it was good but still paled next to Whitney and didn't do Sysha any favors. I thought it was better than that.

Michael Johns -- He sang "It's All Wrong, But It's Alright." This was the other singer Dolly had nice things to say about. (Maybe she just likes cute guys.) Dolly really liked his voice and joked that she hopes he becomes a big star because she thinks she could write some really good songs for him. I've never been a fan of Michael. Yes, he did a really good "Bohemian Rhapsody" in Hollywood Week. But other than that I've been almost completely bored by him. Queen rescued him again, briefly, but not in a way that made me rethink my opinion of him. I am tonight. He did a bluesy, sexy version of this song that had more personality and verve than all his other performances put together. Plus, he held onto the mike and avoided those rock star performances. Really the best performance of the night and the judges agreed by enthusiastically praising him.

I predict the bottom three will be Brooke White, Jason Castro and Ramiele Malubay, with Brooke and Ramiele in the bottom two and Ramiele headed home.

NOTE: By the way, to clear up a debate in the threads about this show, at least this week the clips shown at the end of *Idol* were all drawn from the live performances (including the final number of the night). You can clearly see the audience in some of them and you can always hear them. They might have clips from the rehearsals ready to drop in during the clip reel at the end just in case of



HUFFPOST'S BIG NEWS PAGES

Computers	India	Barack Obama
Michelle Obama	Sports	Olympics
Housing Crisis	Fox News	Cars

[MORE BIG NEWS PAGES](#)

Books by this author

This Blogger's Books from amazon.com.

A cabin of one's own: New England's MacDowell Colony celebrates 100 years of artistic utopia. And the gay and lesbian artists who prospered there celebrate ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

Affairs to remember: Farley Granger bedded Ava Gardner, Shelley Winters, and Leonard Bernstein. In his autobiography, Include Me Out, Hitchcock's muse ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

Related Tags

American Idol, Best Little Whorehouse In Texas, Broadway, Brooke White, Carly Smithson, Country Music, David Archuleta, David Cook, Dolly Parton, FOX, Jason Castro, Kevin Costner. The Bodyguard, Kristy Lee Cook, Michael Johns, Movies, Paula Abdul, Pop Music, Ramiele Malubay, Randy Jackson, Reality TV, Ryan Seacrest, Simon Cowell, Sysha Mercado, Whitney Houston

technical problems but it really shouldn't be a problem to pull even 20 seconds from the last song during the minute or so of judge comments.

Like this story? Get Alerts of big news events. Enter your email address

More in Entertainment...

"Family Guy," "American Dad" Men Talk Hillary...

SNL: Madonna And Angelina In Weekend Update...

Reality Star Jade Goody Buried In Lavish...

Robert De Niro Nanny Sues For \$40,000



HuffPost Stories Surging Right Now

[Michelle Obama's Clothing Has Sean Hannity All Out Of Sorts](#)

[Cenk Uygur: Have We Reached the Tipping Point on Guns?](#)

[RICHARD POPLAWSKI, Pittsburgh Gunman, Kills 3 Police Officers](#)

[Dr. Rachel Ehrenfeld: Does Iran Harbor Osama bin Laden?](#)

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances
Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy w/the Free Videos Toolbar
Videos.alottoolbars.com



Comments

40

Pending Comments

0

[FAQ: Comments & Moderation](#)

[FAQ: HuffPost Accounts](#)

Want to reply to a comment? Hint: Click "Reply" at the bottom of the comment; after being approved your comment will appear directly underneath the comment you replied to

View Comments: [Newest](#) [Expand](#)
[First](#) [All](#)

Musicated [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Musicated](#) [permalink](#)

Ah, we're on the same page with the Clark Brothers who are an incredibly original outgrowth of bluegrass, pop and country. They have an intensity that is an entity all its own and some incredible musicianship to make it work and if you were lucky enough to catch them on The Next Great American Band, you got a chance to see the entire scope of their abilities. By the way, just an aside but during last week's (I think it was last week) performances they had a camera shot of just the hands and dobro of a player in the band and I jammed on my TiVo breaks and said to my wife, that's the dobro player in the Clark Brothers and, sure enough, later on we got a full shot to confirm it so he's been working off and on in Ricky Miner's band.

Ramiele is obviously a very sweet girl but it was necessary for her to leave so that the show could continue with the stronger performers. Something happened to her on the way to the big stage that seems to have overwhelmed her and I think that much of her confidence faded away. Almost predictably, her tear filled performance (why do they make them do that?) was more relaxed and, as a result, better than the night before.

Dolly seemed a bit hoarse to me. Gospel night? I would be all for it but my guess is the producers would never pull the trigger.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 05:12 PM on 04/03/2008

[-] **DCDan** See Profile I'm a Fan of DCDan permalink

Speaking of the Clark Brothers' dobro player ... anyone else notice that his playing was not live? He was moving his hands alright, but it definitely did not seem sync'd to the audio. Hmmm ...

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 05:36 PM on 04/03/2008

[-] **Michael Giltz** See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Hmm, another live vs taped controversy? I'll keep an eye on it but probably just a question of sound and video not synching up as opposed to not playing instruments live, which would be an unnecessary stunt that would not help the singers since a live band can adjust to their actual performance rather than the singers having to strictly stick to a pre-recorded backing track. Musicated, way to spot the dobro player just from his hands. I'm not surprised Idol and NGAB would share musicians, which I assume is the case rather than his being associated with the Clark Brothers.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 12:26 PM on 04/04/2008

[-] **strummerfan** See Profile I'm a Fan of strummerfan permalink

I'm just so glad Ramiele finally left. I couldn't stand to hear her sing another song completely off key. Not only that, I struggled to even hear her over the band and the background singers this week. I will also never forgive her for destroying "Alone" last week.

I'm still on the David C. bandwagon. He's just more interesting than all the other contestants.

The best thing about this week- my ten year old learned that Dolly Parton really did write "I Will Always Love You" and allowed me to put that version on her I-Pod. I've only been trying to convince her that was the best version of the song ever for months. I love Dolly. Quite fond of her version of "Stairway To Heaven" as well.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 11:32 AM on 04/03/2008

[-] **Michael Giltz** See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Yes, it was more than time for Ramiele to go. Next week: Kristy Lee Cook! Dolly has done some great left-of-center covers like "Stairway to Heaven." Less dramatic was her cover of Billy Joel's "Travelin' Prayer" -- the original already had a country-ish flair but it was great fun to hear it performed so well and rescued from relative obscurity.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 12:28 PM on 04/04/2008

[-] **LeoMarvin** See Profile I'm a Fan of LeoMarvin permalink

I'm watching the vote-off show right now and the bottom three, Brooke, Remiele and Kristi Lee, are on stage together. They're all huddled together, hugging... kissing... sobbing... writhing... panting... Oh. Sorry, that's me. There's definitely a more entertaining show here than the producers have figured out how to make.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 02:11 AM on 04/03/2008

[-] **Michael Giltz** See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

There's no question that sex appeal is part of being a pop star, though I believe your Sapphic angle will go unexplored by the show. However, that's what makes the final choices of seasons' past so interesting: it HASN'T been the obvious teen pin-ups you would expect and that the record industry assumes people want. It's been wholesome, healthy looking (ie not stick=thin) Kelly Clarkson, Ruben Studdard, runner-up Clay Aiken, Fantasia, etc etc.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 12:30 PM on 04/04/2008

[-] **OBSERVANTMOM** See Profile I'm a Fan of OBSERVANTMOM permalink

Ok so I figured out where I read about the recaps being from rehearsals:

<http://www.tmz.com/2008/03/19/idol-voters-what-you-see-not-what-you-get/>

I don't exactly consider TMZ a reliable source, so I did a little research. This quotes an MSNBC article and has the link for it at the bottom of the page:

http://www.realityblurred.com/realitytv/archives/american_idol_5/2006_Mar_28_coaching_montages

I wasn't able to compare yesterday's recaps because my DVR cut off early. I did compare last weeks & I could see the difference even in the first performance. They're not big differences, it's mostly facial expressions, hands/feet movement at certain parts of the songs, even my husband noticed it. So now I know it's not just my imagination!

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 01:59 AM on 04/03/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Thanks for digging up the sources, observantmom. You've earned your name. TMZ is definitely not a good source so glad you found something from MSNBC. However, I'm now thoroughly confused. There is no audience in the theater during rehearsals -- otherwise info on what songs the kids were going to sing and how they did would be on the internet even before the show began. That's a given. And in the recaps, you can CLEARLY see the audience in many of the clips so those are absolutely from the live performances. In the rest of them you can hear the audience. Yes, they could take rehearsal footage for some of them and sweeten them with live audience sounds but that would be a lot more hassle than just editing a live clip. The most logical answer is that they always prepare a complete highlight reel from rehearsals in case of some technical issue as a backup. They also probably do in fact tend to use rehearsal footage for the final singer because they've only got 90 seconds or so to prepare for that one to be included. I noticed in comparing that sometimes they chose a different camera angle but that doesn't mean it's a different performance. It's not your imagination: you read it and sometimes (mostly on the last person) they do use a rehearsal clip. Let's check again this week -- and set your DVR to record five minutes past the end of the show.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 12:41 PM on 04/04/2008

gavintiegirl See Profile I'm a Fan of gavintiegirl permalink

Michael,

There is a big dispute going on in my home and YouTube about whether or not Jason Castro flubbed his words. I watched the video over and over again, and I hear and see what you mentioned above, but then my husband and my son watched it and they don't hear "piece of sh" they hear "pieces fit" they admit it sounds garbled but say he did not say sh*t". Also, in the comments, there are people that disagree as well.

Have you heard it to be fact from anyone or is this just your speculation? I want to end this argument for good.

Thanks,
In Fun
gavintiegirl

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 07:36 PM on 04/02/2008

kristineIA See Profile I'm a Fan of kristineIA permalink

You know how sometimes when singers sing an "S" sound it comes out sounding more like a soft "SH" sound? (Liza!) That's what Jason did. He definitely sang "pieces fit".

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 11:45 PM on 04/02/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Well, now I'm sorry that I erased the show (my DVR is always full). No way to make an official ruling since it's open to interpretation. Once you're listening for "piece of sh--" then of course you're more likely to hear it. And of course Jason often sings out of the side of his mouth and has poor enunciation to begin with. It was just speculation on my part based on hearing it live, checking the actual lyrics and then replaying it a number of times. But perfectly possible that kristineIA and others are right. We'll never know until we interview Jason ourselves. Hey, call in to Idol and offer up the question, "Did you mess up the lyrics and almost accidentally curse?" Maybe you'll get on the air and the phone-in segment will actually be fun for once.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 12:46 PM on 04/04/2008

SharonB See Profile I'm a Fan of SharonB permalink

Simon is dead-on usually in his appraisals of the performances on the show. But, his taste in music is SO narrow. He does not like any rap, hard rock, show tunes, country music, or folk songs. He is very negative when reviewing anyone who sings in any of those genres. While none of those is my very favorite, there is good music in each of them.

Brooke has been on my "go home" list since the first night of real competition when she almost pulled a hernia trying to hide her smile and work up a tear for the people who were sent packing. You could tell she really wanted to dance across the stage and scream, "Ha...HA! I am still here!!!!!" She is just a colossal phony and I will be glad to see her voted off.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 07:18 PM on 04/02/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

SharonB you're right about Simon's taste and he would probably be the first to admit it. He's a very smart businessman and has been more successful in the music industry (and now TV industry) than most. But it wasn't because of a talent for picking influential or important artists. It's been for picking moneymakers. He couldn't give a toss about "important" artists, as proven by his comments that Bob Dylan wouldn't have lasted a minute on Idol. (He's wrong actually since Dylan was a very savvy performer who played well with the media.)

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 12:55 PM on 04/04/2008

JamieFrevele See Profile I'm a Fan of JamieFrevele permalink

Why should Carly cover up her tattoos? Because they're there? Get the heck over that, man.

I hate to be unpopular, but there are few things I hate more than country music, and I was bored all night during this one. I'm not denying the influence and musical contributions of Dolly Parton, but oh my heavens, do I hate country music. No one wowed me.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 05:54 PM on 04/02/2008

SharonB See Profile I'm a Fan of SharonB permalink

I agree with you about the country music thing. 99% of it makes my skin crawl. But, there are a very few country songs that I like.

I also agree about Carly's tattoos. Why should she cover them up? They do not affect her voice. I did not have to pay for a single one of them. She is actually one of my faves.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 07:26 PM on 04/02/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Carly definitely agrees with you both since she's never hid them on performance night. But that does limit her to sleeveless tops and that might not be the look she'd want every week so don't feel betrayed if she covers them up at some point. She certainly hasn't hid them to try and make the cut, has she? Hers look cool, but her husband has definitely gone overboard in my opinion.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 12:56 PM on 04/04/2008

Muscated See Profile I'm a Fan of Muscated permalink

Well, following up on my comment last week that David Cook is a very clever and competent competitor (accidental alliteration?) I'd say that he's still on track for the finals with a very surprising version of "Little Sparrow". He's got a little more range than I thought with the slight exception of having to drop off the top note on the final chorus. Nevertheless, he's got guile and the tools to back it up.

O.K., here comes the 'man-love' for David Archuleta. He has spectacular phrasing. Yes, there were some minor pot holes but what he does very successfully is draw you into the song, which is the opposite reaction I get from Brooke White, who makes me decide that perhaps it's time for a bathroom break.

Speaking of Brooke, what you refer to Michael, her seeming inability to understand what she's singing about it precisely the reason that she is mediocre beyond compare. If your goal is to simply attempt to make pleasant sounds (and I'm not sure she's accomplishing that) then you're not interpreting the song and I, as a listener, could care less. As a side note, my wife after the critique noted that her "humble arrogance is weird".

Definitely the best from Michael Johns. He looked and sounded like he was in complete control of the song and not teetering on the edge of a misstep. I've never been a big fan either but that song worked for me technically and emotionally.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 05:35 PM on 04/02/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz permalink

Thanks for backing up Archuleta as a singer and not just a pinup for the pre-teens. he really is a mature singer with good phrasing and an appreciation for the song and lyrics, especially for

his age. Now if we can just ween him off mid-tempo ballady tunes that always have an important message we can keep him from devolving into Josh Groban territory.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 12:58 PM on 04/04/2008

greymen See Profile I'm a Fan of greymen [permalink](#)

David "Archies"-letta is this generation's Rick Astley - cute, bland as shit.

In a quarter-century they will be doing "daverolling" but at least Rick sang original (PWL) songs.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 03:12 PM on 04/02/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz [permalink](#)

Rick Astley had a fine voice and one (or two) really good singles. Archuleta might be a flash in the pan -- you're safe predicting that for any artist who hasn't even recorded an album yet. he certainly seems to be leaning towards Josh Groban-type inspirational songs that will bore me. But I bet he is successful enough to record two or three albums. Maybe he'll show more taste than Astley. Given the wide range of songs fro different eras that Archuleta has already tackled, I wouldn't rule him out yet.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 04:36 PM on 04/02/2008

Charity See Profile I'm a Fan of Charity [permalink](#)

michael buble. david's career, as he grows (and please, what other profession will this boy enter other than show biz with a singing career?) will ride a MOR wave along the very successful lines of michael buble - unless, again as he grows, he loosens up, matures, and shakes us all up by going in a different direction.

archuleta will not be asking anyone "will you take fries with that?" now or in the future.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 07:44 PM on 04/02/2008

There are More Comments on this Thread. [Click Here To See them All](#)

situationcritical See Profile I'm a Fan of situationcritical [permalink](#)

LOVE Dolly Parton.

Hate American Idol. It's contestants cheapen the legends.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 01:37 PM on 04/02/2008

Michael Giltz See Profile I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz [permalink](#)

My friend Aaron said the same thing. He felt this season's contestants didn't even deserve to be mentioned in the same breath as Dolly Parton. Fair enough. Few people do.

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 04:37 PM on 04/02/2008

Guitarsandmore See Profile I'm a Fan of Guitarsandmore [permalink](#)

It's not a cheapening of the legend! It is paying homage to a legend! None of them sounded like the Beatles either but who on earth can? No one!

Favorite Flag as abusive Posted 07:13 PM on 04/02/2008

There are More Comments on this Thread. [Click Here To See them All](#)

Charity See Profile I'm a Fan of Charity [permalink](#)

i hate to sound like a one note samba, but why all the lackluster opinions from the judges to singers who actually CAN sing and hold notes? to not truly like syesha or carly is a mystery. especially syesha. what is up with those tepid and sometimes absurdly wrong remarks about syesha's performances?

oh, she's no whitney, simon says. duh. can he never say anything good about this woman? again, even when he attempts to "flog" brooke it is far less intimidating and damning than when he strikes against syesha, who has far and away the better voice. could brooke hit that note that syesha hit last night? and hold it? hello. absolutely not.

syesha is a damn fine singer who is getting very little respect from anyone connected to this show. and i can't figure that out. even ramiel has gotten more "respect" out of the judges. i sometimes wonder what the hell is going on backstage.

as for carly, my only thought when i saw her this week was "oh dear god please one week, at least, cover up the tats." she has a beautiful face but continues to flash that tattooed arm as if it were a badge of hipness when it only detracts from the song she is singing and her lovely face and kick ass voice. we get it, carly - you're just the hippest of hip. now, do like simon suggested but wouldn't say outloud: COVER UP THE TATTOOS.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 01:00 PM on 04/02/2008

[-] **DCDan** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of DCDan](#) [permalink](#)

I couldn't agree with you more, on both counts, Charity. There is a distinctly different standard when it comes to adjudicating Syesha's performances. Last night's was almost flawless. Yet Simon & Randy seem determined to put her down. It's inexplicable. Almost as if she still needs to prove she deserves to be there while others (i.e., David C, Brooke, Carly) simply need to prove that they are good enough to stay. There were several rough spots in David C's song last night, for instance, but nary a mention of it.

As for Carly, I wish she'd hide the "awesomely cool" tattoo occasionally as well. But that's like expecting a chick who gets a boob job to hide or disguise her prized investments. As with so many narcissistic sporters of tats it becomes their raison d'etre. Pathetic.

On the ongoing debate re highlight reel, my DVR cut out before it was over so I don't know, Mr. Giltz. But if Michael's clip was taken from the actual broadcast that would be an aberration. Of course they're all LIVE performances done in front of an audience! I've never been to a taping but my understanding is they run through the entire show before going on the air to get lighting, camera angles, sound, etc., right. Also, judges are not seeing performances for the first time when we do, which may explain some of their prejudices.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 03:29 PM on 04/02/2008

[-] **Michael Giltz** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Charity, I agree with DCDan that you are definitely right on both points. Carly should hide the tattoo at least some weeks (this would have been a god week given the heartbreak and mellow tone of her version). And I have no idea why Randy and Simon didn't give good to great reviews for Syesha last night. One thing I will say: it's not a plot or some nefarious scheme. Whatever bias they have against Syesha (and I've been biased against Carly and Michael Johns), still when she did so well and got dissed, I was surprised. She looked awfully surprised as well. DCDan, I'll keep checking the highlight reels and am certainly willing to accept the idea that at least the final one is pulled from the practice session. But I did play them back several times and the squeals of fans and artist's singing were exactly the same (even if they used a diff camera angle) at least last night. The mystery deepens!

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 04:44 PM on 04/02/2008

[-] **Guitarsandmore** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Guitarsandmore](#) [permalink](#)

Kristy Lee Cook sounded as country as any country singer around and should get an extra point for hitting that mark. There wasn't the right emotion in the song but in Dolly's original its a very subtle emotion she communicates.

David Archuleto sounds more like Mario Lanza than a country singer but has an amazing voice.

Michael Johns sounds like he is ready to go on tour with the Eagles! He should start a country band of his own.

Seysha Mercado did a great job on "I will always love you". No she didn't sound exactly like Whitney but so what, it was good! David Archuleto doesn't sound like Whitney or Dolly and he still sounds good.

These singers do a lot with the two minutes they are given.. I wonder if any of them can sing for an hour.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 11:27 AM on 04/02/2008

[-] **Michael Giltz** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Given the shots at success that so many Idol contestants have had (the list of their accomplishments keeps growing), I'm sure we'll have a good chance to see what all of the singers you mentioned will be able to do with their own albums and tours.

♥ Favorite ⚙ Flag as abusive Posted 04:45 PM on 04/02/2008

 **mch755** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of mch755](#) [permalink](#)

cont' (apparently I wrote too many words in my last post)
5-8. Syesha/Brooke/Jason/Kristy- I group these singers together. Nothing memorable but nothing glaringly wrong either.

9. Ramiele- ah, little Ramiele. I keep hoping you'll do better but another bland performance. Though admittedly better than last week, but compared to everyone else just plain forgettable. So Mr. Giltz I did not vote for her this week since that performance couldn't possibly warrant a vote from me, even though I'm a big fan, or least was a big fan of hers at the beginning.

As for who is bottom three, my picks are Syesha/Jason/Kristy. I'm not putting Ramiele in there since last week she sang MUCH worse, went on first and didn't even make bottom 3, so her peeps will vote to keep her in. And I see Syesha booted off, which would be unfortunate since she's a far superior singer to Jason/Kristy or Ramiele. Unfortunately she doesn't emotionally connect with viewers or the audience. Plus those baby noises she makes are hideous.

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 03:12 AM on 04/02/2008](#)

 **Michael Giltz** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

Thank you for not voting for ramiele even though she was weak. We've all done it at one point or another (voted for people who weren't the best) but at some point you have to acknowledge the reality. I hope you're wrong about Syesha going home but given the disses by Simon and Randy, you may be right.

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 04:46 PM on 04/02/2008](#)

 **mch755** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of mch755](#) [permalink](#)

well, of course Ramiele was knocked out and would you know it, her farewell performance was actually really good! Heartfelt and a little sad. I guess with no pressure a singer can just cut loose. Well, at least she has the tour to look forward too and no more comments from my coworkers why I kept supporting the little Filipina.

I was a little surprised Syesha wasn't bottom three, but I am glad she made it thru, her voice is too good not to do better in the competition. And that Kristy is making me like her a little more with her self deprecating little note that she was going to the stool instead of the sofa, I gotta admit she's a trooper though I think she should be the next to go.

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 01:44 AM on 04/03/2008](#)

 **mch755** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of mch755](#) [permalink](#)

Have to say I wasn't real familar with Dolly Parton, other than "9 to 5". I have to admit, I'm shocked how many great songs she has written, so yes, now I'm a Dolly fan and will go on Itunes to look up her stuff. This theme night was much better than I thought it would be as I felt most of the singers sang pretty well, no super obvious trainwrecks. Just some minor fender benders. Here's my ranking of the singers:
1. David Cook- sang really well, showing a more tender side to his singing we haven't seen before. He showed a nice versatility. I'm surprised you didn't like it more. I felt this was the best of the night.
2. Michael Johns- I definitely agree with you here, this was a great performance and of course going last is always a plus.
3. Carly- not sure why all the hate from Simon, his comments were quite harsh. I felt she sang well irregardless.
4. David A- Nice, pleasent, but dull. He is just boring me at this point, it feels like all his performances are blending into a big pool of blah for me. I know those words are heresy to the tweens out there, but for many of us adults the cute shtick is tiresome. And I use to really pull for this kid at the beginning!

 [Favorite](#)  [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 03:06 AM on 04/02/2008](#)

 **Michael Giltz** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)

mch755, glad you've been exposed to Dolly parton and liked what you heard. Three great CDs to start with: The Essential Dolly Parton Volume 2 which is a terrific introduction to her early years (except for the treacy "Me and Little Andy"), Trio, her lovely collaboration with Linda Ronstadt and Emmylou Harris and The Grass Is Blue, a marvelous recent bluegrass album with left field covers like Billy Joel thrown in. Can't take too much issue with your reviews, except for future Idol winner David Archuleta.

 [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 04:55 PM on 04/02/2008](#)

 **mch755** [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of mch755](#) [permalink](#)

thanks for the suggestions on the CD's, I checked Itunes last night and Dolly has so

many interesting songs, I didn't exactly know where to start, I basically floundered at my computer for about an hour. At least your CD picks give me a starting point. I can see you've picked your winner already, but I would like to think this is still a competition and we've got another 2 months of this thing! I personally would like to see David Cook win, so now with Ramiele gone I can root for David, Syesha and a new fave of mine, Mr. Michael Johns, who won me over this past week.

♥ Favorite 🚩 Flag as abusive Posted 01:36 AM on 04/03/2008

There are More Comments on this Thread. [Click Here To See them All](#)

Comments are closed for this entry

You must be [logged in](#) to reply to this comment. [Log in](#) or

Ads by Google

Watch Idol Performances
Watch The Idol Performances Free! It's Easy
w/the Free Videos Toolbar
Videos.alottoolbars.com



Google™ Custom Search

[HOME](#) [POLITICS](#) [MEDIA](#) [BUSINESS](#) [ENTERTAINMENT](#) [LIVING](#) [GREEN](#) [STYLE](#) [WORLD](#) [CHICAGO](#) [COMEDY](#) [FUNDRACE](#)

[Advertise](#) | [Login](#) | [Make HuffPost your Home Page](#) | [RSS](#) | [Jobs](#) | [FAQ: Comments & Moderation](#) | [FAQ: Huffpost Accounts](#) | [Contact Us](#)

Copyright © 2009 HuffingtonPost.com, Inc. | [Archive](#) | [User Agreement](#) | [Privacy](#) | [Comment Policy](#) | [About Us](#) | [Powered by Movable Type](#)