



APRIL 2, 2009

- HOME
- POLITICS
- MEDIA
- BUSINESS
- ENTERTAINMENT
- LIVING
- STYLE
- GREEN
- WORLD
- CHICAGO
- COMEDY 23/6
- VIDEO
- BLOGGER INDEX
- ARCHIVE
- Twitter: Follow Us
- Get Email Alerts
- Make HuffPost Your HomePage



Michael Giltz

Freelance writer and raconteur

Posted March 18, 2009 | 11:48 AM (EST)



BIO



Get Email Alerts



Become a Fan



Bloggers' Index

American Idol -- Top 11: Bye Alexis



Read More: [American Idol](#), [Paula Abdul](#), [Pop Music](#), [Reality TV](#), [Ryan Seacrest](#), [Simon Cowell](#), [Entertainment News](#)

Buzz up! Be the First to Submit This Story to Digg

Get Breaking News Alerts

never spam

Share Print Comments

UPDATE: Results night was a doozy. I got the bottom two right: it was Alexis Grace and Michael Sarver and I correctly predicted Alexis would be going home. My only mistake was thinking Adam Lambert would get a scare. Instead it was Allison Iraheta, who handled the pressure gracefully, despite everyone's astonishment. Bye Alexis, your career may be beginning and at least you can take comfort in knowing you definitely left too early. Still, I don't think she would necessarily have

blossomed into a challenger for the finale so the judges made the right call in not saving her. According to Marc Berman of Mediaweek, the Wednesday results show hit a 13.4 rating, which was down 14% from a season ago, far better than the 23% drop of the night before. As one reader pointed out, the overnight ratings do NOT include DVR viewing since obviously those figures aren't available fo 24 hours up to 7 days later. Once those viewers are factored in, the drop in ratings will definitely be less if no completely eliminated.

The night began on a disastrous note, with the entire Top 11 doing a group lip-synch-along to "T-R-O-U-B-L-E." Their voices were massed together in one indiscriminate mix, ruining the only reason for the group sing-along: the chance for someone to outshine and outsing the others. Why would a show built around live performances do a lip-sync? I assume there was some technical reason or perhaps wanting to downplay the stress on Megan Joy. Or something. But it shouldn't happen.

Then we saw the goodbye dinner held for each contestant going home, which includes the contestants, their families and FOX cameras to record every private moment. Everyone shares a testimonial, which must get more awkward as the group narrows down to the final few.

In chatting with the contestants, it was clear Michael Sarver was nervous and thought his number might be up. (Don't go online, Michael! No good can come of it for you.) His hand was shaking and his eyes filled with tears as he described his little daughter asking him, "Why don't you want to be with me anymore?" Good heavens, if he'd told that story the night before Michael would have been

Popular Stories on HuffPost

- Stephen Colbert Rips Apart Glenn Beck: Building His Career On 9/11 (VIDEO)**
Stephen Colbert ripped apart Fox News host (and New York...
- Sarah Palin Disinvited, Newt Gingrich In For Major GOP Dinner**
WASHINGTON -- Alaska Gov. Sarah Palin is out, and former House Speaker Newt...
- "Real Housewives" Countess Dumped By Her Count**
Luann de Lesseps, the countess from "The Real Housewives of New York," is single....
- Alex McCord Laid off? Update Your Resume and Take Time to Admire the Gold Sparkly Drag Queen**
I thought I'd gotten out. A little over...
- Bob Cesca Insane Republicans Reveal An Insane Budget Plan**
It only makes sense that a party currently being wagged by fringe crazy

safe for sure. As it is, the sympathy he earned might ironically keep him away from home for a few more weeks.

They rushed through safe contestants and then faced off Allison Iraheta and Michael Sarver, only to bait and switch us by having BOTH be in the bottom three. A quick glance at the bottom row showed the last two seats were held by Alexis Grace and Adam Lambert.

Brad Paisley, one of the strongest country artists and certainly the funniest of the past decade, delivered his fine new song "Then."

Then we finally paired off Alexis and Adam. Randy threw in a reference to Adam having performed the Jeff Buckley version of "Ring Of Fire," as if that gave it more credibility. I'm no Jeff Buckley expert but I don't see it on any official release. Maybe it's on a bootleg somewhere? I thought perhaps I misheard and Randy said "Tim Buckley" but I don't see him covering it either. Any ideas, anyone? I wouldn't be at all surprised if Jeff HAD covered it and done some sort of Nuskrat take on it. I just can't find it.

But Adam is safe anyway and the bottom three is Alexis and Michael and Allison. (I had Alexis and Michael and Adam with Adam being safe.) Allison is safe so at least I got the bottom two correct. I thought Michael's country crowd would have him just be safe enough, but I began to second-guess myself when reminded country should have been the genre on which Michael should shine the best.

Carrie Underwood and Randy Travis then came out and sang a duet on "I Told You So," a #1 country hit from his seminal album, Always & Forever. In classic country fashion, Carrie was dressed a bit dorkily, with an ugly black bow in her hair and a black sash with white roses slapped on a lovely red dress. But she's a lovely young woman and arguably the most successful recording artist to come out of Idol. Excepting Taylor Swift, she's also the biggest star in country music at the moment and another key reason why Idol has such credibility. And what a great performance: it's already cruising into the Top 20 on iTunes just hours after the show ended.

Finally, Alexis and Michael face off. The judges admit they would consider saving one of them and presumably they mean Alexis. And though Michael seems resigned to going home, actually it IS Alexis who got the fewest votes. Then Simon says they will indeed consider saving Alexis and it all comes down to this performance? Huh? Since contestants can't do another song or rework the song that was not good enough, how can they improve it? Plus, isn't the point of the Save to correct a mistake, either one by the contestant (in this case, Alexis, who did a poorly arranged version of "Jolene") or by the audience (which might assume someone is safe and not vote for them even though they liked the performance). In either case, re-doing the performance would be beside the point. The result was a very awkward, uncomfortable scene with Alexis almost desperately performing the same weak arrangement with a lot more pleading in her voice with the judges both huddling and talking it over while also pretending to pay attention to the performance that was supposed to decide it all. It's not; the judges are supposed to look beyond a bad performance because of general talent OR applaud a good performance that got overlooked by voters.

Here's how to fix it. While the Save is in effect, determine the bottom two and have both of them repeat their performance, which everyone can give their polite undivided attention. Cut to a commercial while the judges debate whether they'd save either one. THEN announce the bottom person and get the judges ruling, with a quick huddle to confirm their decision.

Are you sorry to see Alexis to go or was it the right decision? In my opinion, we should only call it a truly wrong decision if we believe that person was going to make it to the finals. debating whether someone should have been sent home fourth or seventh seems silly to me.

ORIGINAL POST:

It was a topsy turvy performance night on Idol, with Simon looking bored, Paula providing some cogent analysis (again), a minor stumble from Lil Rounds and praise for Anoop. The show was a ratings hit, of course, scoring an 11.9 rating. But **Marc Berman of Mediaweek points out** that's a serious 23% drop from last season. **Hollywood Reporter gives more info:** Idol reached 21.5 million viewers up against serious competition from *Dancing With The Stars*. However, its rating was the

	people like...
	Bonnie Fuller Michelle Obama's Lost Her Mind! 3 Reasons She's Suddenly A Fashion Disaster Touching the Queen wasn't the only...
	April Fools 2009! The Best Pranks Of This Year (VIDEO) -- Car and Driver is reporting that President Obama has ordered all...
	Michelle Obama Hugs Queen Elizabeth, Stirs Controversy (PHOTOS, POLL, VIDEO) *Scroll down for photo, video and poll* UPDATE:
	Obamas Arrive In London, First Leg Of Europe Trip (VIDEO, SLIDESHOW) UPDATE: LONDON - President Barack Obama has arrived in...
	MSNBC's 10 PM Search "On Indefinite Hold," Will Continue Olbermann Repeats NEW YORK — MSNBC will continue airing Keith Olbermann's...
	Obama Meets Queen Elizabeth II At Buckingham Palace (SLIDESHOW) (VIDEO) LONDON - President Barack Obama arrived at Buckingham...
	Angie Harmon: Republicans "Don't Point Fingers" And "Have Class" Angie Harmon gave a lengthy interview to Foxnews.com, and...
	Walgreens Offering Free Healthcare For Jobless, Uninsured NEW YORK — Drugstore operator Walgreen will offer free clinic visits...
	Michelle Obama Oprah Interview: "My Happiness Is Tied To How I Feel About Myself" This month's O Magazine features Michelle...
	Terrifying Horse And Rider Fall During English Race (SLIDESHOW) A harrowing horse fall at the John Smith's Fox Hunters' Chase...

lowest for a Tuesday since the show's debut season when it aired during the summer. There's no denying that *Idol* is the #1 show in the country and the audience will be there come the finale. But week to week people are not as focused on it, which is a shame since this season seems so wide open and the talent is good.

Ken Levine weighs in with his usual caustic commentary here. Michael Slezak of Entertainment Weekly offers **his own obsessive comments here**, while EW's Adam B. Vary **describes the scene in the audience**. Here's the **AP roundup**.

Randy Travis was a good celebrity coach -- you can only do so much in 20 minutes and he wisely limited himself to positive encouragement and small tweaks like suggesting people slow or raise the tempo of a particular song. On the other hand, for a man who was **dogged by gay rumours** for years (Travis was single until he married his manager Lib Hatcher -- she left her husband to manage him and they got married in 1991 just 12 weeks after a tabloid claimed Travis was gay), Travis might have been politer and less shocked by Adam Lambert, who he treated like an alien. Given the rumors that stalked him for years and cast aspersions on the most important relationship in his life, you think Travis would be more careful about ostracizing people for real or perceived differences. But what a voice -- it's one of the best country voices since George Jones and his last album has a stone cold classic, "Dig Two Grave" -- **you can hear it here**.

MICHAEL SARVER -- Sings the Garth Brooks ditty "Ain't Goin' Down Till The Sun Comes Up," **one of 19 #1 country hits Brooks had**. He's kept such a low profile for years, it's easy to forget how stunningly popular Brooks was in the mid 90s. He recorded lots of fun songs, but like Billy Joel's "We Didn't Start The Fire," "Ain't Goin' Down" is practically a novelty record with its rush of words and little opportunity for singing. Sarver ran out of breath and several points and the camera spent too much time on the harmonica player (backup singers and musicians should be seen once, at most during a performance). The judges were polite but mixed, except for Simon who came down hard. Worst of all, it was forgettable.

ALLISON IRAHETA -- Sang "Blame It On My Heart," **a #1 country hit for Patty Loveless**, whose favorite album of mine is probably Mountain Soul. Iraheta's vocals weren't overwhelming -- at times she got drowned out a bit by the band. But she looked and sounded like a pro. This tune -- like the Garth Brooks tune -- has a lot of words in it. The difference is that Sarver sounded like he was cramming all the words in while Iraheta was performing it. Really really strong and more and more a dark horse Kelly Clarkson type every week.

KRIS ALLEN -- Sang Bob Dylan's "To Make You Feel My Love," which appeared on Dylan's classic Time Out Of Mind album. I seem to recall Dylan specifically giving it to Billy Joel to record - or maybe Joel released it as a single before Dylan's album came out? -- but in any case, it's not a Garth Brooks tune as such, though **Joel took it only to #50** on the pop charts (his last single to chart) while Brooks took it to #1 on the country charts. The tune has been recorded by many others since then. I say all this to try and distract myself from Allen's dimples, but even when I replayed his performance and didn't look at the TV screen (where he was poised on a stool and looked sensitive and very Tiger Beat-ish, it was pretty terrific. Like almost everyone last night, he had a very rough time on the last note, which was the only flaw in otherwise excellent performance. Restrained is a word that rarely gets used when it comes to *Idol* but that's exactly what Allen delivered and it was great. Another one coming on strong.

LIL ROUNDS -- Sang the Martina McBride gem "Independence Day," which is practically a standard now, in my opinion. Her performance was also restrained but there's no doubting she seemed a little more tamped down -- until she got to the finale and belted out "DAYYYYYYYY!!!!!" with roof rattling force. But she looked good and the performance was solid. Paula wisely said Lil should not have performed two verses in a row, a good comment that Simon -- who seemed especially bored -- oddly mocked.

ADAM LAMBERT -- Sang Johnny Cash's "Ring Of Fire." Sort of. On *Idol*, the worst sin is to be forgettable and Lambert certainly won't have a problem with that. No one will forget his bizarre rendition of this tune. I could have done without Randy Travis's "I don't even know what to say about the boy" comments. Really? He's been all over the world and is shocked by a dude with black nail polish? But Lambert's uber dramatic singing was ludicrous, to say the least. Paula made a good allusion to Led Zep's "Kashmir," but that's giving this take too much credit. Simon summed it up nicely by saying, "What the hell was that?" I've never been a big fan of Lambert so maybe his fans can weigh in, but to me it revealed his gimmicky vocals once and for all. On the other hand, when I played it back again, it's clear that Lambert is in control vocally and however odd his choices, he has the range to sing it. I assume it was too weird for him to be forgotten and get the

HUFFPOST'S BIG NEWS PAGES



Books by this author

This Blogger's Books from amazon.com.

A cabin of one's own: New England's MacDowell Colony celebrates 100 years of artistic utopia. And the gay and lesbian artists who prospered there celebrate ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

Affairs to remember: Farley Granger bedded Ava Gardner, Shelley Winters, and Leonard Bernstein. In his autobiography, Include Me Out, Hitchcock's muse ... (The national gay & lesbian newsmagazine)
by Michael Giltz

lowest votes, but if he is I'm almost certain the judges would use their Save to give him another chance.

SCOTT MACINTYRE -- Sang Martina McBride's #1 country hit "Wild Angels," yet another in a string of "inspirational" tunes that places MacIntyre squarely in the Josh Groban songbook. MacIntyre simply does not have a good voice. He ran out of breath repeatedly, hit harsh notes, had wavering pitch, was drowned out by the music and had a very thin and weak last note. There was also some lame falsetto somewhere in the middle. The judges were very mixed with Paula and Simon having a good back and forth about whether MacIntyre should always perform with a piano or not. Of course, I don't like Groban either (who can actually sing) and the audience lapped it up.

ALEXIS GRACE -- Sang Dolly Parton's "Jolene," Parton's second #1 country hit as a solo artist and her first tune to hit the pop charts (it went to #60 back in 1974). The song is a perfect fit for feisty Grace since it's about a woman fighting to keep her man from a temptress. My favorite cover is by the [White Stripes](#).) But instead of feisty Grace, she decided to sing the song as if the woman pleading with Jolene had already given up. Parton sounded ready to claw the woman's eyes out and do whatever she had to to save her marriage; Grace sounded defeated. It was meandering and weak, a real shame since Grace has been one to watch. The judges were down on her and worst of all it was forgettable.

DANNY GOKEY -- Sang Carrie Underwood's signature tune "Jesus, Take The Wheel," a big hit with some terrible driving advice for people who skid on ice while in a car. I thought Gokey was fine on the verses and very good on the chorus, though playing it back a second time he seemed a little less focused and all over the place when wailing away. Still, strong and the judges loved it.

ANOOP DESAI -- Sang Willie Nelson's timeless "You Were Always On My Mind," the biggest pop hit of his career. (It reached #5 and was on the charts for 23 weeks, edging out the execrable "To All The Girls I've Loved Before," which also hit #5 but was only on the charts for 21 weeks.) Anoop had his game face on and -- remarkably -- actually delivered. Randy Travis proved his insight by rightly predicting that Anoop's performance would bring about a 180 on people's opinion about his singing ability. Simon said Anoop deserved to be in there and got a fist pump from Anoop (the contestants always know that Simon's endorsement is the most important of all). He really did deliver his own take on the tune without bastardizing it. The only stumble for Anoop was when Ryan asked him if he was surprised by the praise from the judges and Anoop said no, he always expects to do great. Dude, a simple, "I was thrilled" would have played much better.

MEGAN JOY CORKREY -- Sang Patsy Cline's first pop hit, the #12 tune "Walkin' After Midnight," which was a perfect fit for Megan Joy's quirky, Madeline Peyroux voice. Unfortunately, she was waylaid by influenza and even had to go to the hospital, which makes it impossible for me to judge her performance or predict how she'll do. Will audiences forgive her vocals and the dorky hip-shaking? If she's the lowest vote getter, will the judges Save her because of the illness or say that she probably wouldn't win it all anyway? Hard to say.

MATT GIRAUD -- Sang Carrie Underwood's #1 country hit "So Small." He gave, by far, the best performance he's delivered yet and the judges raved. To my count, that means Danny Gokey, Lil Rounds, Allison Iraheta, Kris Allen and -- given the raves generally from the judges -- Adam Lambert are all contenders.

The bottom three: I predict Michael Sarver, Alexis Grace and...Megan Joy? Adam Lambert? Scott MacIntyre? I'm gonna say Adam Lambert (to give him a scare), with Sarver and Grace the bottom two and Alexis Grace going home. What do you think?

More in Entertainment...

Looking For Work with a Knot in...	SPOILER: 'American Idol' Boots Another	'Idol' Judges Distracted By Iraheta's Outfit, Given...	Angie Harmon: Republicans "Don't Point Fingers" And...
------------------------------------	--	--	--

digg™ HuffPost Stories Surging Right Now

[Lee Stranahan: Watch: 5 Benefits To Legal Weed \(& The](#)

["BRUNO" TRAILER! Calamity, African Babies, Chase Scenes](#)

[1 Big Thing Stopping It](#)

[And More \(NSFW VIDEO\)](#)

[Alaska Republicans Want Redo Election For Stevens](#)

[Obama Chia Pet Held Up Behind Santelli On CNBC \(VIDEO\)](#)

Ads by Google

Michael Johns

See Last Night's Idol Performances with the Free Videos Toolbar

Videos.alottoolbars.com



Comments

45

Pending Comments

0

[FAQ: Comments & Moderation](#)

[FAQ: HuffPost Accounts](#)

Post a Comment

Want to reply to a comment? Hint: Click "Reply" at the bottom of the comment; after being approved your comment will appear directly underneath the comment you replied to

Newest

View Comments: **First**

[Expand All](#)

Page: [1](#) [2](#) [Next](#) [Last](#) » (2 pages total)

[here2entertain](#) [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of here2entertain](#) [permalink](#)

No one made it to the top 36 that they didn't want to see go on. Each person will have a chance to make their dreams come true and as long as the audience responds to them, they'll have more chances to stay on the show.

But not everyone has that chance. Anyone wanting a recording career as a music producer, technical, sound engineer, audio engineer, live event audio, mixer, digital editor, post production engineer, guitar technician, mastering engineer, MIDI engineer, studio manager, concert lighting technician, music scoring check out <http://www.recordingconnection.com> Recording School Alternative. Get trained inside the recording world under real professionals on real gigs. Next best thing to American Idol.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 01:48 PM on 03/23/2009

[auramac](#) [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of auramac](#) [permalink](#)

Very bad call. They dumped the wrong person, and the show is getting more and more contrived.

Too much TV. She's the only one I liked. To look at.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 02:07 PM on 03/21/2009

[MsJoanne](#) [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of MsJoanne](#) [permalink](#)

If I had a DVR, I would never watch American Idol live. It has more commercials than any other show I have seen on television.

Why waste what is probably a third of the time allotted for AI watching commercials? DVR baby! Buzz right through all the crap.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 12:43 PM on 03/20/2009

[BabbleOn](#) [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of BabbleOn](#) [permalink](#)

Johnny Cash would have loved Adam's take on Ring Of Fire. He was a bad boy himself once. Check out youtube and search Johnny Cash does Elvis. He's a scream. While you're there, watch Johnny Cash cover Depeche Mode's Personal Jesus, and then look up Kenny Rogers (with the First Edition) singing "I Just Stopped In To See What Condition My Condition Was In." Randy Travis needs to unwedgie and remember where he came from. Give me Sammie and Lorri singing "He Drinks Tequila and She Talks Dirty in Spanish."

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 07:42 PM on 03/19/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

I love Johnny Cash and he certainly was a rebel in country music, despite being such an icon, and would appreciate anyone being true to themselves and damning the consequences. I don't think that reworking of the song worked but have absolutely no objection in principle to it being revamped eight ways to Sunday. There's no point in just imitating Cash. Keep cheering for Lambert -- I'm waiting for him to deliver a performance I can applaud as well.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 12:34 PM on 03/20/2009

schicklett3 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of schicklett3](#) [permalink](#)

Watching those judges "huddle" was the most ignorant thing I've seen them do on Idol (and that's saying a lot). It's obvious the judges do not like Alexis...Simon's snarky remarks to her the past several weeks made it perfectly clear. It's obvious the judges really like Megan - especially Simon. Simon wants Megan to stay and I figure she'll be there for quite some time...even though she can't sing. Paula's comments to Scott to "stop hiding behind the piano and perform more" shows just how stupid she really is. Good performers this year but the judges already have their favorites and will use their dirty tricks to make sure their favorites stay. Their "save" is a license to cheat!

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 08:51 AM on 03/19/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

The judges always root for their favorites. That's their only purpose at this stage. Personally, I don't think one Save to correct something like a great performer who gets overlooked because people assume they're safe or a talented contestant who made a bad song choice is such a horrid thing. They can only do it once, after all. I think Paula is unintentionally right. The piano is masking the fact that Scott can't sing. If he just stood and sang, he'd be eliminated.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 01:32 PM on 03/19/2009

CynicalDog [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of CynicalDog](#) [permalink](#)

I felt badly for the way Alexis was treated. During her auditions the judges told her to "dirty it up", so she dirtied it up (even though that didn't seem to be her natural personality). During final 36 week she was praised for how "dirty" she was, and told by the judges that she reminded them of Kelly Clarkson, and that she was "one to watch". During the first week of the Top 13 she's again complimented for being "dirty". Last night she tones it down a tries to add a blues spin to "Jolene" (as so many of the contestants are raked over the coals if they don't stay in their assigned box, or act like they don't have a set musical identity), and then she's criticized for trying to make the song bluesy. Kara criticized her for not singing a grungier, dirtier song (not those exact words, but it was implied). Poor Alexis seemed to be desperately trying to follow every instruction given by the judges, while trying to also stay in her "blues box", and all she got for her efforts was being booted way too soon. It's just cruel to compare someone to Kelly Clarkson and then tell them they're not worth keeping around after one iffy performance. I actually enjoyed Alexis' "Jolene" -- the note changes made it less predictable, and less reminiscent of Brooke's performance last year.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 07:16 AM on 03/19/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

She def had a rough ride. I thought Alexis would go farther too. While having the judges talk while she was supposedly giving a crucial performance was dumb and didn't look good, I think they championed her and got her within a hair of the Top 10 so it's not like they were intentionally being mean. The fact that Simon said they would consider one of them meant Michael Sarver was a goner and Alexis was worth debating. The Save is new and I think they were just wary of using it too early. I expect they'll use it (if at all) around the final 6 or 5. But unless you expected Alexis to get to the finals (I say expected rather than hoped since she might have kept improving since the way I hope Allison does) then the order of who goes when doesn't really matter in my mind.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 01:42 PM on 03/19/2009

fame [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of fame](#) [permalink](#)

I love your recaps! Fair, unbiased, and I generally agree with everything you have to say.

I was hoping Adam would finally get the boot but he's survived to screech another day. *sigh*

Matt is looking like the dark horse to me but he's going to have a hard time escaping Timberlake comparisons (they DO look something alike) and overcoming Danny's popularity.

The "sing for your life" thing is just cruel. I felt so bad for Alexis, especially since they dangled the possibility of saving her only to say she wasn't good enough after all. Brutal!

Motown next week, yay. I'm excited, it's a theme I could see everyone doing well with.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 05:24 AM on 03/19/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger *I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz* [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

Thx for reading and the nice comment. That's what keeps me working on these every week. I hope I can write entertainingly enough that you'll enjoy it even when you don't agree with me :)

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 01:43 PM on 03/19/2009

anonymost [See Profile](#) *I'm a Fan of anonymost* [permalink](#)

Michael, great article. I presume that the TIVO'd shows are not counted? We have an AI club of over 63 people and we record the show, so that's a heck of a lot of people taping and not watching live. We all go out to dinner and then catch the show on replay 'til about midnight.

When are they going to be able to determine the TIVO/DVR numbers? I think they would be surprised how the ratings are.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 09:57 PM on 03/18/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger *I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz* [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

Hey anonymost, the overnight ratings do not include DVR numbers. But we are starting to get next day and 7 day ratings for shows which do factor in those numbers. Shows like Idol are supposed to be must-see live, but in fact do get a serious bump from DVR. I certainly always DVR it since I almost never watch anything live. You make a good point that the continued penetration of DVRs mean year-to-year comparisons are a little shaky.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 12:30 AM on 03/19/2009

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) *I'm a Fan of GHENT007* [permalink](#)

So Taylor Hicks, Ruben Studdard, katharine mcphoe, were all dropped by j records, all american idol winners, so what is this telling you, that despite the fact that they got major record deals does not mean that they can "SELL RECORDS" THIS IS MY POINT!!! NOW THEY SHOULD LEVEL THE PLAYING FIELD AND ALLOW THE SAME SHOT TO THOSE OF US WHO ACTUALLY CAN SELL RECORDS!!! I REST MY CASE.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 06:08 PM on 03/18/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger *I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz* [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

You name the people who haven't had big success post-Idol and ignore the many people who have. What could you possibly mean by "level the playing field?" Put EVERYONE on national TV who wants to be a music star? How can they give the same shot to everyone? You can't rest your case when you haven't made one. Again, your biggest complaint with Idol or America's Hot Talent is that you didn't make it on the air.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 12:43 AM on 03/19/2009

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) *I'm a Fan of GHENT007* [permalink](#)

I need not name those that are getting the job done, the problem is those that are not, the situation is the selection process is where i have a problem, it's not a problem with the artist, it's not fair to real artists that have been in the field all of their lives, and see artists like taylor hicks and the others, go to the "FRONT OF THE LINE" when they haven't paid their dues, and lack the experience, and talent to

be a real recording artist, the proof is in the fact that they were dropped and no other labels are tearing the doors down to sign them, they need not attempt to put every singer in america on tv, but they can make the selection process a lot fairer, and consider the person's true experience and ability instead of handing a major deal to sub-standard artists who really don't deserve it.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 10:59 AM on 03/19/2009

[There are More Comments on this Thread. Click Here To See them All](#)

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of GHENT007](#) [permalink](#)

If taylor hicks could sell records, why didn't another major sign him after leaving j records, answer: they know he cant sell records!!!!

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 05:50 PM on 03/18/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

Not every winner is the biggest star. Taylor Hicks won Season Five (and just released his second album on march 10). But you conveniently ignore the season's biggest success story: Chris Daughtry, whose band Daughtry sold 5 million copies of their debut album, an absolutely massive amount since last year NO album sold more than 3 million. Kellie Pickler had a #1 country album and might just have more life in her. Elliot Yamin went gold, Katharine McPhee had two Top 40 hits and even BUcky Convington has had success in country with several hit songs and a regular appearance on CMT. Daughtry is a genuine success, though we'll need to see how his followup does to rank him alongside Carrie Underwood and Kelly Clarkson. The rest have clearly been given a platform on which they can make the most of their shot at fame. What more could be asked of a talent show? Huge exposure and then it's up to you.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 12:49 AM on 03/19/2009

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of GHENT007](#) [permalink](#)

Those sales are "SMALL POTATOES" When you compare them to real recording artists such as michael jackson or Whitney houston, these are real artists, that had the experience and know how to be "REAL RECORDING ARTISTS" these other american idol cast-off's, THEY HAVEN'T EVEN SCRATCHED THE SURFACE, if you have real talent, millions of people will see it, and hear it , so they dont impress me with their sales, because with enough air-play and a big enough promotional budget, this is just about average.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 11:13 AM on 03/19/2009

[There are More Comments on this Thread. Click Here To See them All](#)

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of GHENT007](#) [permalink](#)

Look at it this way, if they put up a million dollars on taylor hicks and he only sold 703,000 records then they lost money on him, this is why he is no longer with the "major" label j records and is now selling records from "modern whomp records" this is a fine example of what i'm saying about spending money on people who don't have what it takes to sell records, and then there are some of us who could, but never get a shot or access like taylor hicks did, this is my point!!!! the facts speak for themselves!!!

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 05:29 PM on 03/18/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

Again, the people behind the TV show are not really focused on long-term careers. They're focused on the unbelievable cash cow that is a massive worldwide TV hit format AND in cashing in very cheaply and quickly on whomever wins. That has been the pattern of Simon Cowell's entire career. They did NOT spend \$1 million on Taylor Hicks' album.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 12:50 AM on 03/19/2009

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of GHENT007](#) [permalink](#)

The winner of american idol recieves a million dollar recording contract!!

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 11:15 AM on 03/19/2009

[There are More Comments on this Thread. Click Here To See them All](#)

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of GHENT007](#) [permalink](#)

Another example: Taylor sold a total of 703,000 records, while with j records, he left j records in 2006, 703,000 records by any standard in the industry, is feeble, this is why he's doing grease right now! if you dont even clear a million sales after they spent a million on you to make it happen, you have got to go!!! info provided by soundscan.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 05:06 PM on 03/18/2009](#)

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

703,000 is by any standard lame? You clearly don't know a single thing about the record industry. Last year, not a single album sold three million copies. Lil Wayne had the biggest album with 2.88 million copies and Coldplay was way behind with 2.1 million. Taylor Swift was the best-selling artist with 4 mil copies total, which makes her a massive superstar. Gold is the new platinum in an industry where record stores are disappearing and album sales collapsing. Nonetheless, Taylor Hicks is NOT the big sucess story from his season, which is often the case and Daughtry is indeed a huge success, having sold 5 mil of his debut.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 12:53 AM on 03/19/2009](#)

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of GHENT007](#) [permalink](#)

like i said, with a big enough promotional budget, and enough air-play nationally this works out to be just average, the labels are not making huge profits, but they are not going broke either.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 11:18 AM on 03/19/2009](#)

[There are More Comments on this Thread. Click Here To See them All](#)

GHENT007 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of GHENT007](#) [permalink](#)

Oh i failed to mention, fantasia's is losing her house last i heard, i don't know if she actually lost her home, but if she was doing so well don't you think she could pay her house note!!!

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 04:47 PM on 03/18/2009](#)

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

Fantasia may have financial issues -- big stars often do. That doesn't mean they're not successful. Fantasia is recording her third album and top r&b stars and producers are lined up to work with her. She has huge credibility in the r&b world and a string of massive hits in that genre, not to mention a critically acclaimed and commercially huge success story on Broadway with The Color Purple which she wil duplicate on film when oprah winfrey makes the movie version of that musical. Willie nelson declared bankruptcy. Does that mean he's not a big star?

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 12:56 AM on 03/19/2009](#)

67bug [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of 67bug](#) [permalink](#)

I really enjoyed Adam last night, he was the most creative and took the biggest risk--hats off to him!

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 04:46 PM on 03/18/2009](#)

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger [I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz](#) [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

Clearly you're not alone since he wasn't in the bottom three despite a scolding from the judges. There is no question he is taking risks and listening again to his vocals I do have to respect them even if I still didn't long the performance or arrangement. Maybe he's the male Yma Sumac.

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) [Posted 12:57 AM on 03/19/2009](#)

Furry1968 [See Profile](#) [I'm a Fan of Furry1968](#) [permalink](#)

As my friend says, I look at everything through Adam Lambert glasses, but still, bottom three Michael? Really? YES, lots of folks, including Travis, didn't like it, but what do you think Johnny "produced by Rick Rubin" Cash would have thought? I was a huge Travis fan, closet and all, until the 1,000 points of light business. I can understand AI fans being upset at the cover, but fortunately people can't vote against someone, so the votes AGAINST Lambert will be split 10 ways, and Lambert's fans,

accustomed to what makes his performances special, will keep right on voting his way - last night did nothing to discourage them. And after Go-Key's JESUS TAKE THE WHEEL, I think my Blue State-Red State finale is shaping up. I expect ANY DAY now for Go-Key to write GIVE BACK on his hand for the camera, a repeat of 2008's most assinine move! REGARDLESS, always enjoy reading the blog...

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 02:21 PM on 03/18/2009

Michael Giltz - Huffpost Blogger *I'm a Fan of Michael Giltz* [permalink](#)



[See Michael Giltz's Profile](#)

Thx for reading! Glad to hear Adam has passionate fans. I'm waiting for him to give a performance I can cheer on. You're right about the fan voting. The best thing about Idol is that you vote FOR someone you like rather than vote to boot someone off. At this stage, all you need is a core fanbase to keep you safe and clearly Adam has that.

And of course I was wrong about Adam being in the bottom three. Your finale prediction could still come true and would certainly be a fun contrast in styles. Gosh, I'd forgotten about that GIVE BACK on the knuckles moment. Not something I wanted to be reminded of :)

[Reply](#) [Favorite](#) [Flag as abusive](#) Posted 01:00 AM on 03/19/2009

Page: 1 **2** [Next](#) [Last](#) » (2 pages total)

You must be **logged in** to reply to this comment. [Log in](#) or

Ads by Google

Michael Johns

See Last Night's Idol Performances with the Free Videos Toolbar

Videos.alotoolbars.com



Google™ Custom Search

[HOME](#) [POLITICS](#) [MEDIA](#) [BUSINESS](#) [ENTERTAINMENT](#) [LIVING](#) [GREEN](#) [STYLE](#) [WORLD](#) [CHICAGO](#) [COMEDY](#) [FUNDRACE](#) [ARCHIVE](#)

[Advertise](#) | [Login](#) | [Make HuffPost your Home Page](#) | [RSS](#) | [Jobs](#) | [FAQ: Comments & Moderation](#) | [FAQ: Huffpost Accounts](#) | [Contact Us](#)

Copyright © 2009 HuffingtonPost.com, Inc. | [Archive](#) | [User Agreement](#) | [Privacy](#) | [Comment Policy](#) | [About Us](#) | [Powered by Movable Type](#)